CULTURAL ROUTES AND U.S. PRESERVATION POLICY

by

JAMEE NICHOLE FIORE

(Under the Direction of Cari Goetcheus)

ABSTRACT

Cultural routes represent an amalgamation of tangible and intangible heritage. Routes guide culture, societies, movements, peoples, and the individual through changes in character, morals, ethics, and experiences. Cultural routes move people in waves of social developments. Additionally, routes interlace history and stories intentionally to express and teach these concepts to the viewer.

Interpreting routes in this manner broadens the interpretation beyond typical trade, communication, and migration routes to a modern interpretation of American history, which includes minorities and social movements in the United States. Cultural routes express modern American history through a combination of tangible and intangible resources shaping the lives of its people. Although world cultures recognize cultural routes through a variety of designation mechanisms, the United States has not. The research here defines the potential of U.S. cultural route designation, a process of such designation and the tangible benefits of such designation through economics and tourism.

INDEX WORDS: Cultural routes, historic preservation, international preservation, ICOMOS, UNESCO, Council of Europe, preservation policy, trail, heritage routes, intangible cultural heritage

CULTURAL ROUTES AND U.S. PRESERVATION POLICY

by

JAMEE NICHOLE FIORE

Bachelor of Arts, University of North Florida, 2011

A Thesis Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of The University of Georgia in Partial

Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree

MASTER OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

ATHENS, GEORGIA

2013

CULTURAL ROUTES AND U.S. PRESERVATION POLICY

by

JAMEE NICHOLE FIORE

Major Professor:	Cari Goetcheus
Committee:	James Reap
	Gary Green
	Beth Byrd

Electronic Version Approved:

Maureen Grasso
Dean of the Graduate School
The University of Georgia
December 2013

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Asheley Faris, Jennifer Bailey, and Dan Hall: Thank you for your help in editing and preparing this document, which means a great deal to me. I could not have done it without you. To my family (you know who you are), thanks for all of your encouragement and support even when we did not agree. To my good friends Melody, Catherine, Milton, Seth, Lilly, Nick, Lindsay, Erik: thank you for making graduate school an amazing experience. To the class after me: keep on, keeping on. I will miss spending time with you interesting people. Asheley and Frank: thanks for keeping me calm, positive, and motivated while writing and researching this and for the lovely breaks.

Cari Goetcheus, thank you for your guidance and understanding as well as interest in my future and topic. Cari, James Reap, Gary Green, Beth Byrd, I could not have successfully completed this without your support and expertise; thank you for helping me and spending your time creating this experience. Scott Brown, thank you for inspiring me to work on this fascinating topic.

To all of you: thank you for caring about my future.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Cultural heritage encompasses various forms of tradition and identity, such as belief systems, knowledge, behaviors, social relationships, or materials. The idea melds aspects of heritage and identity formed from ethnicity, religion, or age. Generally, societies leave tangible cultural heritage fragments behind. Domestically and internationally, different methods for preserving these tangible heritage forms exist. Within the last few decades, protected items and intangible cultural heritage have become a major focus in the preservation field. Agencies worldwide define heritage resources, both tangible and intangible, in several categories. Tangible cultural heritage consists of physical items and remnants left behind, such as buildings, artifacts, bones, books, or pottery. Intangible cultural heritage consists of oral traditions, practices, and knowledge, such as the Japanese building technique known as Tatami.[1] Because of the encompassing nature of cultural heritage, both tangible and intangible forms of cultural heritage express the tradition of cultures. The ultimate expression of a culture's intangible and tangible heritage is through their migration and settlement patterns. These patterns have manifested themselves in the form of cultural routes. Cultural routes serve as the overlap between tangible and intangible heritage, and this research focuses on them as a primary example of heritage preservation.

---

[1] UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 2000 onwards and the drafting of the Convention." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization. (Intangible Heritage, About Intangible Heritage, Working towards a Convention, 2000 onwards)

Cultural routes gained interest among preservationists within the last thirty years due to interest from member states of the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).[2] A few leading international preservation organizations such as UNESCO, the Council of Europe (COE), and the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) aided in the development and expression of cultural routes as interest in the topic grew. Since the 1980s, these organizations have worked with their member states to establish definitions, categories, and criteria for the designation and protection of cultural routes. These organizations have also worked to establish the essential characteristics of cultural routes. UNESCO, COE, and ICOMOS individually created different definitions for each type or category of cultural routes, according to that organization's mission. Along with the definition and criteria, cultural route designations require certain mechanisms and processes allowing for their implementation or recognition in these organizations. These mechanisms, which differ by organization, include designation processes, definitions, criteria, categories of routes, and purpose of individual routes. It should be noted that the UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS cultural routes definitions focus on immense age, mainly ancient to several centuries old. This seemed to exclude routes found in the short history of the United States. By omitting routes with a shorter history, it ignores a large part of U.S. history, cultural identities, and struggles to create a more inclusive society.

UNESCO, COE, and ICOMOS are international organizations that have developed programs for designating cultural routes as a significant part of cultural heritage and preservation of cultural identities. However, in the United States, cultural

---

[2] UNESCO. "Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage (Madrid, Spain, November 1994)." December 12-17, 1994. Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage. *World Heritage Committee.* 18th Session. Phuket, Thailand.

routes are not fully acknowledged by the preservation community, despite the country's

membership in UNESCO and ICOMOS. While interested in intangible cultural heritage,

the United States preservation community focuses on the intangible through folklife and

music. Although the United States' preservation framework consists of laws and

organizations on national, regional, state, and local levels, few, if any of these laws and

organizations address cultural routes as an important form of the country's cultural

heritage. With adjustments, the United States' preservation framework could

accommodate a method for the acknowledgment of cultural routes and their

documentation.

<div align="center">Research and Methodology</div>

This thesis explores the possibility for designation of cultural routes in the United

States. The following question provides the general framework for the research and

methodology: How could the United States' preservation system acknowledge and/or

accommodate cultural routes? From this overarching question, the research provided

explores the following questions defining and shaping the research methods:

- What are cultural routes?

- Are there existing processes and/or mechanisms to guide development of a

  U.S. proposal?

- How do we adapt the current preservation system to accommodate cultural

  routes?

Answering these questions will help establish a foundation allowing for the designation

and implementation of cultural routes in the United States.

The research methods covered in this thesis allow for further explanation and interpretation of cultural routes and their eligibility for historic designation within the existing framework of cultural heritage in the United States. The methodology consists of a literature review covering existing definitions of tangible and intangible heritage, definitions of heritage resources and cultural routes, and existing world and United States organizations with mechanisms allowing for designation and implementation of cultural routes. Following that effort, the research analyzes the gaps between current cultural routes' designation and implementation processes in the United States. As a result of analysis, this thesis proposes a method to fill the missing mechanisms with a new definition allowing for the consideration of cultural routes as a form of tangible and intangible heritage in the United States.

CHAPTER 2

OVERVIEW OF TANGIBLE AND INTANGIBLE

Several tangible and intangible characteristics of cultural routes enable inclusion

as a form of cultural heritage in the United States. This chapter discusses the different

definitions of tangible and intangible culture as presented by UNESCO, ICOMOS, and

COE and the evolution of international definitions and standards. Not only have the three

organizations defined heritage forms, but also they have identified cultural routes as a

prominent form of cultural heritage. The research for tangible and intangible culture as it

pertains to cultural routes is limited by the lack of academic or scholarly resources. This

chapter looks at the policies, charters, and suggestions made by the international leaders

in heritage preservation. Additionally, this chapter looks at intangible culture in the

United States. The tangible and intangible research presented here is limited by resources

and tries to start the discussion of preservation for intangible resources in the United

States.

Tangible and Intangible Heritage

Heritage is a permanent component of a society, independent of an individual.

Although heritage exists regardless of an individual, it is nonetheless a vital component

of one's identity. Heritage can be cultural, like secular Judaism; it can be ethnic or race

related, as in the Japanese culture; or it can simply be one's history, lineage, family, or

friend connection, something gifted to one upon the passing of another. The Merriam-

Webster dictionary defines heritage as "property that descends to an heir, or something

transmitted by or acquired from a predecessor." Similar to heritage, cultural heritage

encompasses a larger society or region. The Getty Research Institute defines cultural

heritage as:

> The belief systems, values, philosophical systems, knowledge, behaviors, customs, arts, history, experience, languages, social relationships, institutions, and material goods and creations belonging to a group of people and transmitted from one generation to another. The group of people or society may be bound together by race, age, ethnicity, language, national origin, religion, or other social categories or groupings.[3]

Generations pass-on heritage through lineage, which differentiates a society. On the other

hand, cultural heritage evolves and adapts to each generation as its interpretation changes.

UNESCO divides cultural heritage into two categories: tangible and intangible. Tangible

cultural heritage is divided amongst these categories:

- Monuments: architectural works, works of monumental sculpture and painting, elements or structures of an archaeological nature, inscriptions, cave dwellings and combinations of features, which are of outstanding universal value from the point of view of history, art or science;
- Groups of buildings: groups of separate or connected buildings which, because of their architecture, their homogeneity or their place in the landscape, are of outstanding universal value from the point of view of history, art, or science;
- Sites: works of man or the combined works of nature and man, and areas including archaeological sites, which are of outstanding universal value from the historical, aesthetic, ethnological, or anthropological point of view.[4]

This definition of tangible cultural heritage shows changes in interpretation depending on

the culture making said interpretation, whether it is UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, or the

United States. When dealing with cultures from the past, cultural heritage entails

---

[3] The Getty Research Institute. *Art and Architecture Thesaurus*, online ed., s.v. "cultural heritage."

[4] UNESCO. (1972) *Convention concerning the protection of the world cultural and natural heritage.* Paris, France (section 1, article 1)

maintaining material, such as archaeological artifacts, rock carvings, or ruins.[5] The

National Park Service notes, "By preserving those artifacts, we gain insight into the

culture of the groups that crafted them, how their societies functioned, and how they

lived."[6] When dealing with contemporary cultures, cultural heritage focuses on aiding

groups with "retaining, understanding, and enjoying their cultural identity."[7] Therefore,

cultural heritage maintains the tangible and intangible cultural aspects in current memory

because of how they shaped our society.[8]

Additionally, preservationists safeguard cultural heritage through cultural

resources. The National Park Service defines a cultural resource as:

> An aspect of a cultural system that is valued by or significantly representative of a
> culture or that contains significant information about a culture. A cultural resource
> may be a tangible entity or a cultural practice. Tangible cultural resources are
> categorized as districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects for the National
> Register of Historic Places and as archaeological resources, cultural landscapes,
> structures, museum objects, and ethnographic resources for National Park Service
> management purposes.[9]

Tangible heritage includes the physical remnants of the past, comprised of built

environment, like buildings, historic places, monuments, and artifacts. These tangible

resources are the foundation for the existing preservation system in the United States.

Examples of tangible resources include the Capitol building in Washington, DC, the

Space Shuttle Enterprise, or the Etowah Indian Mounds in Georgia.

Over the last thirty years, a stronger interest in intangible cultural heritage has

evolved. Intangible heritage includes the impalpable fragments of the past, such as oral

---

[5] National Park Service, "Teaching Cultural Heritage Preservation." p. 1
[6] Ibid.
[7] Ibid.
[8] Ibid.
[9] National Park Service, "NPS-28: Cultural Resource Management Guideline." Appendix A: Glossary, s.v. "cultural resource"

traditions, social practices, and regional knowledge. Intangible cultural heritage encompasses cultural aspects such as oral traditions, social practices, rituals, performing arts, festive events, knowledge, or practices concerning nature and the natural world, and knowledge or skills used to produce traditional crafts.

Evolution of an International Definition and Standard

In this time of globalization, there are efforts to preserve tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural diversity on a worldwide scale. The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) suggests understanding intangible heritage aids intercultural dialogue allowing for a mutual respect among varying societies. An early UNESCO attempt to understand and protect intangible cultural heritage and resources was in Africa in the 1930s when they conducted a ten-year study and developed a plan for African oral traditions and African languages, which was adopted in 1946.[10] The study included "the first Festival of the Arts of the Pacific held in Fiji and two series of cultural studies on Latin America."[11] Interestingly by comparison, the 1972 UNESCO convention clearly defined cultural heritage as identification with tangible objects or tangible heritage limiting the focus of studies to structures or sites and not including the intangible component.[12]

At a meeting in 1977, the Accra Intergovernmental Conference on Cultural Policies in Africa advocated for broadening the definition of cultural heritage so the definition would include world views, value systems, and beliefs.[13] In 1982, the World Conference on Cultural Policies in Mexico City expressed that "cultural identity was the

---

[10] UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 1946-1981: first steps." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization. (Intangible Heritage, About Intangible Heritage, Working towards a Convention, 1946-1981)
[11] Ibid.
[12] Ibid.
[13] Ibid.

defense of traditions," and that one passes morals, spirituality, and ethics through

generations with current customs holding the same significance as habitual customs.[14]

Furthermore, UNESCO claims the greatest element of discussion from this conference

was "that the attention now being given to the preservation of the 'intangible heritage'

may be regarded as one of the most constructive developments of the past decade. It was

one of the first times that the term 'intangible heritage' was officially used."[15] Lastly, the

Conference concluded intangible heritage possesses inimitable worth because of the

uniqueness of customs, culture, and identity of each society. The General Conference of

UNESCO at the 1989 meeting adopted the *Recommendation on the Safeguarding of

Traditional Culture and Folklore*, setting the first legal precedent considering the

preservation of intangible cultural heritage.[16]

The 1996 UNESCO World Commission on Culture and Development issued the

report, *Our Creative Diversity*, which makes a statement emphasizing the values of

diversity and the intangible forms of heritage. The report states that, "there is a need to

reassess such conceptions as well as to develop better methods of identifying and

interpreting our heritage. It is essential to understand the values and aspirations that drove

its makers, without which an object is torn from its context and cannot be given its proper

meaning. The tangible can only be interpreted through the intangible,"[17] establishing the

importance and relevance of intangible heritage. *Our Creative Diversity,* goes on to say

that heritage improves and preserves tangible or intangible by propagating knowledge,

---

[14] UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 1982: Mondiacult (Mexico)." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization. (Intangible Heritage, About Intangible Heritage, Working towards a Convention, 1982: Mondiacult, Mexico)
[15] Ibid.
[16] Ibid., (Intangible Heritage, About Intangible Heritage, Working towards a Convention, 1989: Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore)
[17] World Commission on Culture and Development, p.34

"enriching humanity's awareness of its heritage, and promoting deeper mutual

understanding and respect between cultures," which contributes to cultural identities.[18] In

1997, UNESCO introduced the *Proclamation of Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible*

Heritage of Humanity, legitimizing the importance of intangible heritage to the world.

Moreover, the combination of the documents, *Our Creative Diversity* and *Proclamation*

of Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity established an

awareness and protection of culture and folklore, or intangible cultural heritage.

In 2001, the UNESCO Director-General submitted a report to the Executive

Board analyzing international regulations on intangible heritage asserting the creation of

a new standard. The report states:

> The basic principles of such a new instrument might be: that intangible cultural
> heritage be fundamentally safeguarded through creativity and enactment by the
> agents of the communities that produce and maintain it; that the loss of intangible
> cultural heritage can only be prevented by ensuring that the meanings, enabling
> conditions and skills involved in its creation, enactment and transmission can be
> reproduced; that any instrument dealing with intangible cultural heritage facilitate,
> encourage and protect the right and capacity of communities to continue to enact
> their intangible cultural heritage through developing their own approaches to
> manage and sustain it; and that sharing one's culture and having a cultural
> dialogue foster greater overall creativity as long as recognition and equitable
> exchanges are ensured.[19]

Moreover, these principles lead to the recommendation for the use of the term "intangible

cultural heritage," as opposed to "folklore," and a provided a draft definition for the

term.[20] Finally, in 2002 the "first intergovernmental meeting of experts on the

preliminary draft convention for the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage" met

---

[18] World Commission on Culture and Development, p. 50

[19] UNESCO. Executive Board, 161st 2001, Paris. *Report on the Preliminary Study on the Advisability of Regulating Internationally, Through a New Standard-Setting Instrument, the Protection of Traditional Culture and Folklore.* 161 EX/15-pages 5-6.

[20] UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 2000 onwards and the drafting of the Convention." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization. (Intangible Heritage, About Intangible Heritage, Working towards a Convention, 2000 onwards)

to create a final draft defining intangible cultural heritage for the worldwide organization to utilize for future preservation efforts.[21]

From all of this discourse, a desire arose to add intangible cultural heritage on the World Heritage List due to the vast wealth of knowledge passing between generations. In the process of regulating the discussion on intangible cultural heritage of humanity, UNESCO created the Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage at the General Conference held in Paris in 2003. The convention referred to the *Universal Declaration on Human Rights of 1948*, the *International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights of 1966*, and the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights of 1966*.[22] The convention's major concern involved "intangible cultural heritage as a main-spring of cultural diversity and a guarantee of sustainable development."[23] The convention discussed the settings and general provisions the committee would use to implement its goals.

After the formation of the General Conference in Paris 2003 convention, UNESCO created an Intangible Heritage List by establishing criteria for designation, UNESCO agreed a State Party must submit each heritage requesting designation as a nomination and satisfying all five criteria.[24] Additionally, UNESCO categorizes

---

[21] UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 2000 onwards and the drafting of the Convention." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization. (Intangible Heritage, About Intangible Heritage, Working towards a Convention, 2000 onwards)

[22] This information, as well as the full convention, can be found on UNESCO's website under the search "Text of the Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage."

[23] UNESCO, Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage p.2

[24] The five criteria are as follows: 1) Meets the definition of intangible cultural heritage as outlined in Article 2 of the Convention: The 'intangible cultural heritage' means the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artifacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage. This intangible cultural heritage, transmitted from generation to generation, is constantly recreated by communities and groups in response to their environment, their interaction with nature and their history, and provides them with a sense of identity and continuity, thus promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity. For the purposes of this Convention, consideration will be given solely to such intangible

intangible heritage as four distinctive entities: First, intangible cultural heritage is traditional, contemporary, and living all at once including congenital heritage and a collection of contemporary groups' diverse practices. Second, intangible cultural heritage is an inclusive form of preservation encompassing shared expressions practiced by others from around the world. Migration and adaptations of various groups allow intangible heritage to evolve and create a new sense of identity and continuity. Intangible heritage does not give rise to questions regarding whether or not practices are specific to a culture. However, it invites individuals to share their identities with the whole allowing the individual to feel joined to a culture. Third, intangible cultural heritage is community identity, meaning it envelops communities and the knowledge of their traditions, skills, and customs continuing through generations. Fourth, UNESCO suggests the community defines intangible cultural heritage. Only the community can consider intangible heritage and those people create, maintain, and transmit it. The outside viewer cannot define intangible heritage without the community's recognition because the viewer does not know what the community's traditions, skills, and customs involve.

Discourse on Intangible Cultural Heritage in the US

Numerous cultures exist in the United States (U.S.) from descendants of the original peoples (Native Americans) to the thousands of immigrants who established their lives here. For the past four hundred years through the process of settlement, these

---

cultural heritage as is compatible with existing international human rights instruments, as well as with the requirements of mutual respect among communities, groups and individuals, and of sustainable development.

 2) Listing of the element aids in the visibility and awareness of intangible cultural heritage as a crucial element for protection to provoke dialogue, recognizing "cultural diversity worldwide and testifying to human creativity."

3) Sophisticated safeguarding procedures protecting and promoting the element.

4) All parties must be contacted and give consent to the listing of the element.

5) The nomination must be in the country or territory of the State Party requesting its listing.

cultures brought with them their heritage, identity, and customs. No longer identifying solely with their ancestral characteristics, people adopted cultural traits from other immigrants creating a unique cultural heritage. According to the U.S. Department of State's *eJournal USA* article, "American culture remains vibrant and of global interest precisely because men and women in every part of the nation preserve intangible forms of artistic cultural expression by living them."[25] In 1967, the Smithsonian Center for Folklife and Cultural Heritage (CFCH) "established heritage preservation programs in collaboration with diverse local communities in and outside the U.S."[26] The CFCH was one of the first movements towards recognizing and preserving intangible cultural heritage in the United States. However, not until the 1990s was intangible heritage defined and a method for its preservation introduced.

Aside from the CFCH's effort, approximately three other programs in the United States government focus on the preservation of intangible culture.[27] Created in 1928, the Archive of American Folk Song collects American music made between the years 1890 and present day. The US Library of Congress' American Folklife Center was established in 1976 and preserves tangible and intangible culture. Lastly, the National Endowment for the Arts, created in 1965, offers grants to "encourage and promote visual art, music, dance, and storytelling."[28] Christina Kreps, who wrote "Indigenous Curation as Intangible Cultural Heritage: Thoughts on the Relevance of the 2003 UNESCO Convention," argues that, in addition to its definition of intangible cultural heritage,

---

[25] U.S. Department of State, International Information Programs. "A Living Legacy: Preserving Intangible Culture." *eJournal USA* vol. 15, no. 8, p. 1
[26] Ibid., p. 4
[27] Ibid., p. 35
[28] U.S. Department of State, International Information Programs. "A Living Legacy: Preserving Intangible Culture." *eJournal USA* vol. 15, no. 8, p. 35

UNESCO included "cultural expressions like festivals and the performing arts, i.e. musical, dance, and theatrical traditions, intangible cultural heritage also encompasses oral traditions, traditional craftsmanship, knowledge and skills, cultural spaces, and social practices related to intangible culture."[29] Two of the first U.S. preservationists to define intangible cultural heritage were Thomas King and Patricia Parker. King and Parker wrote National Register Bulletin 38 regarding Traditional Cultural Properties, which states:

> In the 1980 amendments to the National Historic Preservation Act, the Secretary of the Interior, with the American Folklife Center, was directed to study means of: preserving and conserving the intangible elements of our cultural heritage such as arts, skills, folklife, and folkways… and to recommend ways to: preserve, conserve, and encourage the continuation of the diverse traditional prehistoric, historic, ethnic, and folk cultural traditions that underlie and are a living expression of our American heritage.[30]

Most importantly, their contribution built on the then UNESCO definitions of intangible cultural heritage by reinforcing the foundation UNESCO established on cultural properties. King and Parker helped to lay the groundwork for the inclusion of intangible cultural heritage into the existing framework of the U.S. historic preservation program.

---

[29] Kreps, Christina. "Indigenous Curation as Intangible Cultural Heritage: Thoughts on the Relevance of the 2003 UNESCO Convention." *Theorizing Cultural Heritage* vol. 1, no. 2 (2005), p. 5

[30] King, Thomas and Patricia Parker. "Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties." *National Register Bulletin* no. 38 (1998), p. 2

CHAPTER 3

CULTURAL ROUTES: INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

UNESCO and Cultural Routes

As previously described, UNESCO established the idea of intangible cultural

heritage in the late 1980s, allowing for scholarship about the topic and associated

resources to move forward. In 1993 UNESCO listed the Pilgrim's Route to Santiago de

Compostela, a pilgrimage route through France and Spain ending at the church of

Santiago de Compostela, as a World Heritage Site. As a result, Spain noted its desire to

analyze the topic of cultural routes to a greater degree.[31] In 1994, UNESCO's World

Heritage Committee Board approved the topic of cultural routes noting, "the nature of the

concept is open, dynamic, and evocative, bringing together the conclusions of the global

strategic study striving to improve the recognition within Heritage 'of the economic,

social, symbolic, and philosophical dimensions and constant and countless interactions

with the natural environment in all its diversity.'"[32] The committee argued that heritage

routes are a rich and fertile resources offering a privileged framework and approach to

one's history.

The criteria for consideration of the inclusion of routes falls within a "global

vision of exchanges" consisting of materials, cultural and spiritual routes, tangible and

intangible combinations, culture and nature.[33] In order to include cultural routes as a part

---

[31] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage (Section 1. Aim of the Meeting)
[32] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage (Section 2.b.)
[33] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage (Section 3.b.)

of world heritage UNESCO states a proposed cultural route needs to include these

concepts:

> They are based on the dynamics of movement and the idea of exchanges, with
> continuity in space and time; refers to a whole, where the route has a worth over
> and above the sum of the elements making it up and through which it gains its
> cultural significance; highlights exchange and dialogue between countries or
> between regions; is multi-dimensional, with different aspects developing and
> adding to its prime purpose which may be religious, commercial, administrative
> or otherwise.[34]

The Committee argued that one identifies a cultural route based on its strengths, tangible

elements, and the significance of the route as a whole. Furthermore, the route must

consist of authentic elements, duration, and current use. Finally, the committee

recognized a cultural route by the people affected by the intangible and symbolic

elements along the route.

The World Heritage Committee considers the defining elements of a route as its

"cultural worth," which "can be measured by the dynamics (commercial, philosophical,

religious) which it may have generated or favored (transfer of goods, knowledge, know-

how) and by the symbolic significance it represents for anyone using it (or for anyone

who may have used it, or for anyone referring to it)."[35] Examples of peoples' historical

routes include the Odyssey,[36] Silk Route, Salt Route, Rum Trade Route, Spice Trade

Route, Wagon Trail, Pilgrimage to Santiago, Pilgrimage to Mecca, Slave Routes,

Crusades, Napoleon's Route, and Roman Routes.[37] However, the research reveals that

distinction exists amongst these types of routes due to religious events, trade activities,

---

[34] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage (Section 4.b.)
[35] Ibid., (Annex 3, Section 1. Typology: defining elements)
[36] The Odyssey is one of two major ancient Greek poems written by Homer, following Odysseus' journey
home from the battle at Troy a journey that took ten years.
[37] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage, (Annex 3, Section 1. Typology: defining elements)

military campaigns, sports events, and more.[38] Furthermore, this report given by the

World Heritage Committee suggests that some routes represent a specific event or

moment in history, exchanges between cultures or people, and acts of aggression and

imperialism.

World heritage cultural routes are a social phenomenon, allowing for time to pass

and the phenomenon to become a part of our heritage, as opposed to an expression of an

exceptional moment.[39] The World Heritage Committee intends to consider routes that

include exchanges and journeys, and not just routes limited strictly to a road used for

traveling. Criteria for cultural routes with universal cultural heritage value consideration

are:

- Spatial characteristics: The length and diversity of a route reflect the interest of the exchange and the complexity of the links that it maintains.
- Temporal characteristics: How long the route existed and the frequency of use, which could be multiannual, annual, and seasonal. The route must have established its identity through diachronic practice over sufficient time to leave its imprint on mankind.
- Cultural characteristics: The route includes cross-cultural aspects or effects; it links remote ethnic and cultural groups to foster their mutual progress through exchange or its capacity to bring together different peoples.
- Role or Purpose: The route's use to exchange spiritual goods, religious or philosophical, or basic necessities for the survival of communities or has contributed to their development such as trade in foodstuffs, minerals, manufacture good, and more.[40]

These criteria allow the World Heritage Committee to distinguish the routes and divide

them into several categories, discussed later in this section. U.S. preservationists may be

able to use these criteria to identify U.S. cultural routes and either list proposed U.S.

cultural routes in the National Register of Historic Places, or designate them as a part of

the National Historic Trails System.

---

[38] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage, (Annex 3, Section 1. Typology: defining elements)
[39] Ibid.
[40] Ibid.

UNESCO should accurately identify cultural routes as World Heritage Sites and list them, in order to benefit from protection and development as a preservation concern. The identification should include descriptions of whether the route is on land, river, sea, or elsewhere. In addition, items to take into consideration are the extensive changes humans enacted to the environment over the decades. Great changes occurred as a result of human influence causing disastrous effects, such as political events like war, as well as hazards from natural disasters like floods and droughts. Preservationists often employ efficient means of identifying cultural routes. For example, preservationists look at departure or arrival, or lodging places, such as churches, hostels, and hotels. Other considerations are watering holes for animals and people in the form of fountains and springs, or wells, and passing places such as fords, bridges, mountain passes, and ports along traditional journey routes.[41]

It is important to document the path and sites along the path, to collect information on all aspects of the route. The Committee mentions: "We have to add these aspects of specific interactions between human groups over and beyond political barriers. The Committee's definition does not only include the objects, products, or the results of direct exchange but also any indirect and subsequent products, which have had more important cultural consequences such as the introduction of Buddhism into China."[42] UNESCO developed an inventory process to keep track of cultural routes. Routes bring together communities on a regional basis, "aided by existing core elements in the field of human sciences in the regions under consideration."[43] UNESCO establishes a group in

---

[41] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage, (Annex 3, Section 2. Material nature)
[42] Ibid.
[43] Ibid., (Annex 3, Section 3. Inventory method)

each region to consider this idea, and each group collects available knowledge about each regional route in the area.

UNESCO uses three criteria to delimit a route: spatial, temporal, and cultural. Spatial criteria show route's sites, monuments, buildings, and other areas of influence the path followed.[44] Temporal criteria cover the route's beginning, its end, the frequency of its use, and the intensity of its use and variations.[45] Cultural criteria relates to the impact of a route. The cultural criteria examine the volume and the nature of the exchange along the route, such as men, goods, and technologies.[46] UNESCO uses both spatial and temporal criteria to decipher the exact material nature of the route.

UNESCO approves cultural routes intersecting in numerous areas and becoming regional or international passages to be included as a part of World Heritage. The submission process includes a joint application for each route approved by each area, region, or country the route passes through. The application process risks different approvals or priorities by UNESCO for the individual countries. For instance, a country submits an application for a site fully within their country, rather than submit a joint application for a route. However, there is concern when a route divides multiple regions or countries regarding legislation, management, protection, funds, and ownership.[47] The communities involved in the protection of these routes explore, maintain, research, and visit the routes. The key elements of UNESCO's cultural routes are outlined in Table 3-1.

---

[44] UNESCO, Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage, (Annex 3, Section 4. Delimitation criteria)
[45] Ibid.
[46] Ibid.
[47] Ibid., (Annex 3, Section 5. Submission procedures)

Table 3-1 Summary of Key Elements of UNESCO's Cultural Routes

Key Dates	1980s interest in topic; 1993 Santiago de Compostela listed as a World Heritage Site; 1994 World Heritage Committee Board approved topic for further discussion
Purpose	Routes offer constant and countless interactions with the natural environment. They are rich and fertile resources that offer a privileged framework and approach to ones history. They are identified because of its strengths, tangible elements, and the significance of the route as a whole.
Concepts	Based on the dynamics of movement and the idea of exchanges with continuity in space and time. Refers to a whole - where the route has a worth over and above the sum of the elements and through which it gains its cultural significance. Highlights exchange and dialogue between countries or regions. Is multi-dimensional with different aspects developing and adding to its prime purpose, which may be religious, commercial, administrative or otherwise. Tangible elements, holistic, authentic elements, duration, current use, people affected, intangible and symbolic
Definition & Examples	Routes combine exchanges and journeys and exclude those limited to physical way used for travelling. Routes recognize and protect aspects of specific interactions between groups over and beyond political barriers, because they are rich resources and identified because of their strength. *Examples* religious, events, trade activities, military campaigns, sports events
Criteria	Measured by dynamics (commercial, philosophical, religious) which it may have generated or favored (transfer of goods, knowledge, and know-how) and by the symbolic significance it represents for anyone using it (or for anyone who may have used it, or for anyone referring to it). Consisting of materials, cultural and spiritual routes, tangible and intangible combinations, culture and nature. *Spatial characteristics* - the length and diversity of a route reflect the interest of the exchange and the complexity of the links that it maintains. *Temporal characteristics* - how long it has been in existence and the frequency of use, it must have established its identity through diachronic practice over sufficient time to leave its imprint on mankind. *Cultural characteristics* - the fact that it includes cross-cultural aspect or effects; it links remote ethnic and cultural groups and fosters their mutual progress through exchange or its capacity to bring together different peoples. *Role or purpose* - the fact that it has been used to exchange spiritual good, religious or philosophical, or basic necessities for the survival of communities or has contributed to their development.
Process	*Identification* - accurately identified for protection and development concerns based on the concepts and criteria. *Definition* - thorough description of what could qualify for designation. *Inventory* - organized on a regional basis, application process/multi-regional, approved by each area, region, country that the route passes through (ownership of routes). *Spatial* - path the route followed; its sites, monuments, buildings. *Temporal* - over route's beginning, its end, frequency of use, intensity of its use and variations. *Cultural criteria* - impact of the route, limitations, and meaning regarding type of exchange that the route was created for

Council of Europe and Cultural Routes

Aside from UNESCO's exploration of cultural routes, the Council of Europe, another European based organization working to protect world heritage, engaged in the discussion of cultural routes. The Council of Europe (COE) is a unifying group founded in 1949 and comprised of forty-seven countries. The COE focuses on the preservation of human rights and protection of individuals while acknowledging and promoting the various cultural identities found throughout Europe. In 1987, the COE created the Enlarged Partial Agreement (EPA) on Cultural Routes, furthering the discussion and definitions of cultural routes. The COE started the program to promote the journey of shared European cultural heritage.

According to the COE, cultural routes contain the "fundamental principles of the Council of Europe: human rights, cultural democracy, cultural diversity and identity, dialogue, mutual exchange and enrichment across boundaries and entire centuries."[48] In 2010, in order to increase efforts across nations to preserve cultural routes, the Council of Europe adopted a resolution that enabled co-operation amongst European states to develop cultural routes.[49] The *Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe* indicates the complexities of European culture, demonstrating common themes in European values such as peoples, migration, and currents of civilization. COE suggests that, by creating this program, it redraws the networks of the European map by creating joint university courses, raising schoolchildren's and students' awareness of cultural comparisons and

---

[48] Council of Europe. "Cultural, Heritage, and Diversity: Enlarged Partial Agreement On Cultural Routes." Council of Europe.

[49] For more information about the resolution refer to the Council of Europe: Resolution CM/Res(2010)53 establishing an Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes. Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 8 December 2010 at its 1101st meeting of the Ministers' Deputies

differences, creating a more open-minded view of cultural heritage, and establishing common purposes which recognize the true character of European public service.[50]

In order to designate a cultural route through the COE, one must adhere to a specific set of rules and procedures. According to the COE, the route must meet six criteria:

1) The route must demonstrate European values shared between several countries.
2) Experts from various regions and in multiple fields must research the route's themes to guarantee equal exposure for all of the peoples who occupy the route.
3) The route must reflect some part of European history, memory, or heritage and add to the interpretation of modern Europe.
4) Be able to engage young people's educational and cultural interactions with the sites and therefore align with the Council of Europe's matter for those fields.[51]
5) The route must allow for development and pioneering projects addressing cultural tourism and sustaining cultural development, involving things such as the Green Movement into preservation practices.
6) The route must consider and allow long-term multidisciplinary projects through networks in the Council of Europe.

Cultural Routes stem from a thematic designation suggested by member states, local or regional authorities, project initiators, or by the Council of Europe Secretariat. The COE categorizes a theme under peoples, migrations and the spread of the major European philosophical, religious, artistic, scientific, technical, and commercial movements. The COE designated these routes because they highlight the cultural progress that created European civilization. Based on civilization, these routes acknowledge the ideas of cultural progress and the affected regions and sites in Europe.

---

[50] Sorina Capp. The European Institute of Cultural Routes (4.2 Development of the Program)
[51] Freeman Tilden is one of the first people to dedicate a book to the Interpreting Our Heritage, which is used in most interpretative studies.

Lastly, the routes incorporate the prosperity and variety of traditions and across European

cultures.

> According to the COE, cultural routes embrace four broad concepts:
>
> 1) Historic pathways, which occur during a historic period such as a pilgrim way
> and trade or migration routes via land or sea
> 2) A circuit and route, which have a better understanding of interregional themes
> because they connect various regions of Europe. Therefore, circuit and routes
> bring-out "the common human, cultural, social, geographical, and economic
> characteristics predating current national borders."[52]
> 3) Geographic networks, which collect common objects, are networks, which
> reproduce archetype such as monasteries within towns and cities.
> 4) A cultural network, representing the creativity, skills, and training learned
> through cultural and artistic exchanges and practices. For example, pilgrim
> pathways, silk and textile routes, monastic influence routes, European cities and
> discoveries route, Gypsy routes, fortified military architectures in Europe and
> Phoenician routes.[53]

Based on these four broad criteria, the COE uses the Enlarged Partial Agreement

on Cultural Routes (EPA) to reinforce sustainable territorial development and social

cohesion, focusing on European unity, history, culture, and values as well as the

discovery of lesser-known sites.[54] The EPA on Cultural Routes addresses preservation

and the diverse involvement of associations, local and regional authorities, universities,

and professional organizations as well as on itineraries and cultural projects. Similar to

the UNESCO Intangible Heritage List, the Council of Europe lists routes seeking to

acquire a "Cultural Route of the Council of Europe" certification. However, there are

four requirements specific for COE cultural route certification: First, routes focus on a

theme representative of European values. Second, routes follow a historic route or a

newly created route. Third, routes acknowledge and practice long-term multilateral co-

---

[52] Sorina Capp. The European Institute of Cultural Routes (I. Themes)

[53] Sorina Capp. The European Institute of Cultural Routes (Different Cultural Routes)

[54] Council of Europe: Cultural, Heritage, and Diversity: Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes
(Key Objectives of the Program)

operation projects. Finally, routes can be managed by an independent or organized network.[55]

Although the Council of Europe works to establish this route certification, unlike UNESCO, the COE does not have the authority to govern cultural routes. To offer further guidance, the Council of Europe and the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg created a non-profit organization called the European Institute of Cultural Routes. Moreover, this organization intends to continue the work the Council of Europe Secretariat started. The European Institute of Cultural Routes (EICR) took on responsibilities explicit to the new rules for eligibility for the Cultural Routes program. The EICR processes propositions for themes and activities for an Advisory Committee to review. The EICR manages the program networks by assessing work, advising the partner organizations to promote the programs' projects, setting new goals and creating inter-network ties. The EICR began a database regarding the connection between culture and tourism, and it focuses on regional development, interpretation, and information for people working in either the cultural or tourist fields. The key elements of COE's cultural routes are summarized in Table 3-2.

---

[55] Council of Europe: Cultural, Heritage, and Diversity: Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes (Operational Framework)

Table 3-2 Summary of Key Elements of COE's Cultural Routes

Key Dates	1987: Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes; 2010: adopted resolution enabled co-operation amongst European states to develop cultural routes
Purpose	Creating a more open-minded view of cultural heritage and establishing common purposes that recognize the true character and complexities of European public service. Promote a journey of heritage through shared cultural heritage. Routes contain fundamental principle/mission of the COE: human rights, cultural democracy, cultural diversity and identity, dialogue, mutual exchange and enrichment across boundaries and centuries. Routes allow for sustainable development. Raising schoolchildren's awareness of cultural comparisons and difference.
Concepts	Route must demonstrate European values that are shared between several countries. Experts from various regions and in multiple fields must research the route's themes to guarantee equal exposure for all of the peoples that occupy the route. Must reflect some part of European history, memory, or heritage and add to the interpretation of modern Europe. Engage young people's educational and cultural interactions with the sites and therefore align with the COE's matter for those fields. Must allow for development and pioneering projects that address cultural routes and sustainable cultural development, involving things such as the Green Movement into our preservation practices. Must consider and allow long-term multidisciplinary project through networks in the COE.
Definition & Examples	A European Cultural Route is taken to mean a route crossing one or more countries or regions. Routes are organized around themes that are historical, artistic, or social interest is patently European, either by virtue of the geographical route followed or because of the nature and/or scope of its range and significance. Application of the term *European* to a route must imply a significance and cultural dimension which is more than merely local. The route must be based on a number of highlights, with places particularly rich in historical associations, which are also representative of European culture as a whole. *Examples* pilgrim pathways, silk and textile, monastic influence, European cities and discoveries, Gypsy, fortified military architectures
Criteria	*Themes*: categorized under peoples, migrations and the spread of the major European philosophical, religious, artistic, scientific, technical, and commercial movement. *Four types: Historic pathways* - occur during a historic period and trade or migration routes via land or sea with a modern facet. *Circuit and route* - interregional themes connecting various regions of Europe, bringing common human, cultural, social, geographical, and economic characteristics. *Geographic networks* - consist of towns and cities that have a collected common objective or reproduce the archetype such as monasteries. *Cultural network* - represents the creativity, skills, and training learned through cultural and artistic exchanges and practices.
Process	*Designation* - rules and procedures. A route is suggested by member states, local or regional authorities, project initiators, or COE Secretariat, therefore becoming a certified "Cultural Route of the Council of Europe", by meeting the above criteria. The theme is representative of European values, follow historic route or newly created route, acknowledge and practice *long-term multilateral co-operation project*, and be managed by an independent or organized network. COE has created a governing body - European Institute of Cultural Routes - that manages routes, archives, and a database.

The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes

After the Council of Europe devised a definition and process for the creation, governance, and maintenance of cultural routes in 1987, the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) furthered the discussion in 2008 and created the ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes. The Charter on Cultural Routes defines the various aspects of cultural routes and what ICOMOS decided to accept as a cultural route. Through the involvement of cultural heritage and the sites classified as cultural properties, ICOMOS created a document that helped further define cultural properties as they related to heritage on various levels. ICOMOS asserts that cultural routes introduce a new ethic of conservation; it considers properties and sites as a common heritage, breaking national and regional borders and joining communities in an effort to preserve what ideologies they share. Furthermore, the organization states a cultural route acknowledges the properties as part of a whole and demonstrates heritage as a valuable "resource for sustainable social and economic development" between the various communities. [56]

ICOMOS believes the idea of a cultural route helps to associate natural, cultural, and historical settings into a larger dynamic, recognizing heritage as a much broader and intricate concept. The organization suggests cultural routes support an evolutionary process combining the diverse contributions of the various peoples who create the abounding cultural heritage. Recognizing multiple cultural heritage sites as a group sharing a common formality allows peoples who visit and maintain those sites to recognize and contribute to preservation as a cause protecting cultural heritage sites.

---

[56] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p.1

Considering the collection of cultural routes as a new way of looking at heritage, it not

only built on an environment that still exists, but also expands it to include the

"phenomenon of human mobility and exchange"[57] created through communication routes

or trading routes.

> ICOMOS notes a cultural route extends
>
> "beyond its character as a way of communication or transport, its existence and significance . . . can only be explained by its use for such specific purpose throughout a long period of history and by having generated heritage values and cultural properties associated to it which reflect reciprocal influences between different cultural groups as a result of its own peculiar dynamics."[58]

A cultural route comes from a need to obtain a specific objective or serve a specific

purpose, such as the Incan and Roman Empire Routes, the Route to Santiago de

Compostela, the African trade caravan, and the Silk Route. Due to the all-encompassing

nature of cultural routes and the various fields of knowledge found at these sites, their

study and management necessitates a multidisciplinary methodology inspiring a historic,

cultural, technical, and artistic knowledge.[59]

In 2008, ICOMOS wrote the Charter on Cultural Routes, which defines, regulates,

and establishes what constitutes a cultural route for their organization. The Charter

established that a cultural route is any route of communication via land, water, or

physically surrounded and classified by a particular historic function to provide a greater

resolute purpose. According to ICOMOS, a route must meet three conditions. First, it

must develop from movements of people as well as a continuous exchange of goods or

ideas, knowledge, and values between countries, regions, and continents over time.

---

[57] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p. 2

[58] Ibid.

[59] Ibid.

Second, it must illustrate intercultural exchange in regards to the cross-fertilization between cultures of their tangible and intangible heritage influences on the route. Last, it must demonstrate the historic relationships amalgamated from an active arrangement between the peoples and the cultural properties associated with the route.[60]

Moreover, a cultural route occurs in a natural or cultural context where the route had a significant influence on peoples and aids in characterizing and enhancing the peoples in an interactive process.[61] The content of a cultural route is such that the tangible elements on the route indicates people experienced the cultural heritage and demonstrates corporeal evidence of its survival. Tangible objects provide physical sense and meaning to the route as a whole. The communication route itself is a crucial tangible component and acts as a mechanism of human activity that aids in achieving the route's goals. Additionally, elements, such as customs offices, places for storage, lodging, hospitals, markets, ports, fortifications, bridges, communication, and transport, make up the route. Industrial sites, such as mining, manufacturing, and trade, that demonstrate the technical, scientific, and social exchange in different eras, as well as urban centers, cultural landscapes, sacred and devotional sites, also exist on routes. Intangible cultural heritage is also a part of the cultural route and contributes to the exchange between peoples, by representing their ideas, languages, traditions, or music.

ICOMOS holds the idea that a cultural route supplies a stronger collective value, rather than as individual units; this is a concept known as "gestalt." The various cultures involved in the route enhance the cultural route and make each site more valuable

---

[60] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p. 8

[61] Ibid., p. 3

because they connect through a unified characteristic. Although each site has an individual character, it contributes to the whole, unifying the sites beyond their individual significance and allowing a collective significance to emerge. The route's span links together the peoples, countries, regions, and continents, allowing them to share ideas. This expansion includes the physical path and the varying heritage elements found on the route. Cultural routes need to present physical evidence of its historic path and cultural heritage while simultaneously acting as a channel for the cultural influences traveling on the route.

Furthermore, ICOMOS suggests a cultural route is a cultural phenomenon because it "does not obey natural laws or casual phenomena, but rather exclusively [obeys] human processes and interests."[62] Intangible cultural heritage forms a part of the foundation contributing to the fluidity of the cultural route. This is a better approach to the conversation about the route due to the route's ability to influence units of communication between peoples and the route's settings. The geographic setting aids in the form of the route via land or water, which determines the path of the route and influences the path as it evolves.

One sees the framework for the route through the territory, which influences the character, as well as the atmosphere of the physical and intangible nature, and contributes to the comprehension of the route. The relation of cultural routes to their settings, such as natural and cultural landscapes having identities of their own, enhances the route's diversity. Along the cultural route the landscape changes, altering the character of the

---

[62] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p. 4

route with it. In the case of the built environment, the landscape not only affects the route, but also affects the buildings, such as chapels, monasteries, fountains, and bridges.

While protecting a cultural route, one must consider the historic, natural, and cultural characteristics of the route, and one must keep any infill or repair within the context and respect of the distinguishing attributes of the original route, so as not to distort the traditional landscape. Furthermore, ICOMOS attempts to establish a buffer zone to account for a clearly defined boundary of the cultural route, permitting the preservation of material and immaterial values from modern encroachments in order to preserve a route's authenticity. In order to consider a route a cultural heritage experience, ICOMOS requires two main indicators. The first main indicator is the amount of remaining physical evidence of the route itself, whether boundary lines or buildings support the purpose of the route. The second indicator is how intangible cultural expressions are present and carried between the peoples of the route, such as traditions, customs, linguistic, culinary, music, handicrafts, technological skills, and other learned historic functions.[63]

ICOMOS classifies Cultural Routes into six categories: 1) territorial range: local, national, regional, continental, or intercontinental; 2) Cultural range: within the regions of the route that have shared influences, or evolution of cultural values; 3) Goal and function - social, economic, political, or cultural elements; 4) Duration of time - routes no longer used and routes developing due to cultural changes over time; 5) Structural configuration: linear, circular, radial, or network; 6) The route's natural environment: land, aquatic, mixed, or other setting. When considering the identification of a cultural

---

[63] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p. 6

route, ICOMOS looks at the tangible and intangible ideals of any route's cultural

heritage, so as to establish the functional purpose of a cultural route. One studies and

acknowledges intangible heritage as a large piece of the foundation for any cultural route

in regards to the peoples who occupied the route, and its physical uses. If one defines a

living cultural route, one must look at the historic data and the evolution in order to

continue the development of the route and its purpose. Along with the identification

process, ICOMOS requires all cultural routes to meet authenticity and integrity

guidelines, which include meeting the above criteria for definition of a route and

demonstrating evidence of integrity through physical and intangible remnants. Therefore,

the route continues to maintain its representation of the historic function or purpose.

ICOMOS generally defines the methodology for a route's research, assessment,

protection, preservation, conservation, use, and management. All of the guidance

establishes a specific ideology used to recognize significant cultural routes and their role

with tangible and intangible cultural heritage. ICOMOS created an identification,

integrity, and authenticity process to designate cultural routes. When identifying a

cultural route ICOMOS considers:

> [The route's] specific functionality to serve a concrete and well-determined
> purpose; the tangible and intangible values of its heritage dynamically generated
> as a result of reciprocal cultural influences; its structural configuration, its whole
> geographic and historic context, its natural and cultural setting, whether the latter
> is urban or rural, and its corresponding characteristic environmental values; its
> relationships to the landscape; its duration in time, and its symbolic and spiritual
> dimension, all of which will contribute to its identification and to the
> understanding of its significance.[64]

---

[64] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes."
October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly.
Quebec, Canada., p. 7

To understand cultural routes requires a fundamental understanding of their intangible elements because they are a large contributor to the significance and heritage of the route. To evaluate the route as a whole, there needs to be a study of the significance of a cultural route and the parts making up the route. A living cultural route is a route in existence because of its legacy and heritage, and it is in continuous use by the people whose ancestors started the route. The Pilgrim's Route to Santiago de Compostela is a good example because it is in use today even though it now incorporates new developments like tourism or non-pilgrims traveling the route. When maintaining a living cultural route, one should document the historic purpose of the route even if the current purpose is altered from the original. One examines the alterations with their relationship to the original purpose for the functional relationship of the two. Lastly, the tangible and intangible elements contribute to the significance of the route and possess complete representation of the route's important elements.

According to ICOMOS, to prove authenticity, a cultural route must form the integral basis of the route and demonstrate the credibility of elements expressed through the natural and cultural environment and the tangible and intangible elements of the route. ICOMOS applies the criteria to all sections of the route to review the significance in relation to the route's meaning as a whole, including the entirety of the route's development and the validation of the authenticity of the foundations through the remnants of the path. The Charter on Cultural Routes states, "authenticity should also be evident in the natural and cultural context of each stretch of the Route subject to analysis and assessment, as well as in the other tangible and intangible heritage elements included

within its historic functionality and its setting."[65] If a physical section of the route is missing, then that section is not preserved through a historiography of the intangible items and immaterial sources that relay their meanings. Any methods used to preserve, protect, and manage the route must meet the authenticity criteria. ICOMOS proposes several research teams at each of the major characteristic points along the route using similar instruments, methodologies, and practices and maintaining proper communication to benefit the groups. Differing types of cultural heritage properties and sites along the routes exist, and one should accommodate these differences with various methods. Lastly, regions where the route might intersect should consider how they could best aid the route.

ICOMOS describes the protection process as including the assessment, preservation, and conservation of the route. There is no efficiency when granting a route the protection of heritage elements given on a partial or random basis.[66] Moreover, routes should include a rigorous inventory regarding the elements of the route along with reports of the integrity and authenticity, demonstrating the value of the items and how these items influence the route's significance.[67] However, the field requires further research to establish a strategy to avoid or prepare for adverse effects of development and neglect on the route. The Charter on Cultural Routes states, "all of this requires the establishment of a system of coordinated legal measures and appropriate instruments that guarantee that the Route will be preserved and its value and significance highlighted in a holistic

---

[65] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p. 7
[66] Ibid., p. 9
[67] Ibid., p. 8

fashion."[68] In order to understand the heritage of these routes and the value they carry, one prioritizes any intervention altering or affecting the route's significance. In order to stabilize development, one must use cultural routes to encourage important social and economic activities.[69]

In order to promote knowledge about cultural routes along with their appropriate and sustainable use for tourism purposes, one adapts the appropriate measures aimed at eliminating risks. For a cultural route, one harmoniously integrates a supplementary infrastructure for tourist activities, access routes, information, interpretation, and presentation. The primary condition is not to jeopardize the meaning, authenticity, and integrity of the historic values of the cultural route as key elements conveyed to visitors.[70]

Cultural routes measure tourism based on environmental impact studies for the route, as well as plans for public use and participation.[71] Cultural routes act as a medium for cooperation and understanding of the cultures and civilizations forming the route.[72] More importantly, providing a holistic purpose to promote and maintain each individual part of the route promotes and maintains the route as a whole. When managing a cultural route, the significance of the route combines policies and development along with the importance of the route to ensure its integrity and authenticity stays intact.[73] The key elements of ICOMOS's Charter on Cultural Routes are summarized in Table 3-3.

---

[68] ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada., p. 9
[69] Ibid., p10
[70] Ibid., p11
[71] Ibid., p. 10
[72] Ibid.
[73] Ibid.

Table 3-3 Summary of Key Elements of ICOMOS's Cultural Routes

Key Dates	2008 Charter on Cultural Routes, direct the definition of cultural properties as they relate to heritage on various levels
Purpose	Routes introduced a new ethic of conservation that considers properties and sites as a common heritage that breaks national and regional borders and joins communities in an effort to preserve what ideologies they share. Acknowledges properties as part of a whole and demonstrates heritage as a valuable resource for sustainable, social, and economic development between multiple cultures. Helps to associate natural, cultural, and historical settings into a large dynamic that recognizes heritage as a much broader and intricate concept. Routes offer a functionality to serve a concrete and well-determined purpose. Tangible and intangible values of its heritage dynamically are generated as a result of reciprocal cultural influences.
Concepts	Must have developed from movements of people as well as a continuous exchange of goods or ideas, knowledge, and values between countries, regions, and continents over time. Influenced by and reflects the intercultural exchange between cultures in regards to the cross-fertilization of their tangible and intangible cultural heritage. Must demonstrate the historic relationships that have amalgamated from an active arrangement between the peoples as well as the cultural properties associated with the route.
Definition & Examples	Beyond its character - as a way of communication or transport. Its existence and significance as a cultural route can only be explained by its use for such specific purpose throughout a long period of history; and by having generated heritage values and cultural properties associated to it which reflect reciprocal influences between different cultural groups as a result of its own peculiar dynamics. Developed from movements of people and continuous exchange of ideas, knowledge, and values. Influenced by and reflect intercultural exchange between cultures in regards to cross-fertilization of their tangible and intangible. Demonstrate historic relationships that have amalgamated from an active arrangement between the peoples and the cultural properties associated with the route. Elements making up the whole - offices, storage, lodging, hospitals, markets, ports, fortifications, industrial sites, mining, manufacturing, and trade that demonstrates technical, scientific, and social exchange in different eras and urban centers, cultural landscapes, sacred and devotional site, and intangible cultural heritage. Examples Santiago de Compostela, Roman, Incan, African trade caravan.
Criteria	Its structural configuration, its whole geographic and historic contact, its natural and cultural setting whether the latter is urban or rural, environmental value, relationships to landscape, duration in time, symbolic and spiritual dimension. Categories: *Territorial range* - local, national, regional, continental or intercontinental. *Cultural range* - within the regions of the route that have shared influences, or evolution of cultural values. *Goal and function* - social, economic, political, or cultural elements. *Duration of time* - routes that are no longer used and those that are still developing due to cultural changes over time. *Structural configuration* - linear, circular, radial or network. *Natural environment* - land aquatic, mixed, or other setting.

Process	Defines, regulates and establishes criteria. *Identification* looks at the tangible and intangible ideals of any route's cultural heritage, which are defined in order to establish the *functional purpose* of a cultural route. *Integrity* is demonstrating evidence of integrity through physical and intangible remnants. *Authenticity* continues to maintain its representation of the historic function or purpose, evident in the natural and cultural context of each stretch of the route. *Methodologies for research, assessment, protection, preservation, conservation, use, and management*.

United Kingdom and National Trails

The United Kingdom (U.K.) cares for its heritage resources through organizations

similar to that of the National Park Service in the United States. One organization,

relevant to Cultural Routes is the National Trails organization. This research examines

how a singular nation handles its routes as opposed to the international level seen through

UNESCO, ICOMOS, and COE. In the U.K., National Trails are created "by linking

existing local footpaths, bridleways, and minor roads, and by developing new ones where

there were gaps."[74] A National Trail Officer or Manager manages and maintains that

National Trail according to the nationally agreed standards.[75]

> "Each National Trail Officer co-ordinates maintenance, improvement and promotional work on the ground. Much of the maintenance work is undertaken by the local highway authority together with landowners and, often, with the help of volunteers. Funding for National Trails is provided by national government through Natural England and Natural Resources Wales and also by local highway authorities and other funding partners."[76]

The U.K. National Trails are purposed for "contributing to local economies and tourism"

through aspects of enjoyment, local economic benefit, environmental enhancement, and

---

[74] National Trails. "About the National Trails." United Kingdom National Trails, (What are National Trails?)

[75] Ibid., (What are National Trails)

[76] Ibid.

civic engagement.[77] Trails are created through the Public Rights of Way (PRoW) section of the National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act 1949 Part IV, which describes PRoW as being "highways that allow the public a legal right of passage."[78] There are three ways to establish Public Rights of Way:

1. Express dedication – where the landowner has given the public a right of use over their land;

2. Presumed dedication – where the public have used a right of way for a longer time than anyone can remember; or

3. Deemed dedication – where a right of way has been in use for 20 years or more.[79]

This is a public-private partnership between "local authorities and landowners and occupiers."[80] "Local authorities must produce a map and statement showing the rights of way that exist in their area. They must keep these maps up to date and investigate any evidence that suggests a right of way has been left off or included on the map by mistake, or has been recorded incorrectly."[81] This is part of the management plan for PRoWs.

Part IV of the PRoW section continues with a discussion of Long-Distance Routes, which have been the basis for the National Trails organization. These Long-Distance Routes are created and maintained so the people are able to enjoy them without the use of mechanical vehicles. Long-Distance Routes are submitted to the Minister under a report process, also found in Part IV of the PRoW section. The minister decides

---

[77] National Trails. "About the National Trails." United Kingdom National Trails, (What are National Trails?)

[78] Natural England. "What is the legal status of public rights of way?" United Kingdom Natural England, (Rights of Way, Legal statue of public rights of way)

[79] Ibid.

[80] GOV.UK, Inside Government. "Policy, Protecting and improving people's enjoyment of the countryside." United Kingdom GOV.UK, (Policy)

[81] Ibid., (Policy)

whether the route is approved, with or without changes, or rejected altogether. After he makes his decision, the Minister gathers with partners, the National Park authority, the Agency, planning board, county council, and district councils to determine to which areas the route relates.[82] There are four types of PRoWs

1. Footpath – open to walkers, way marked with a yellow arrow

2. Bridleway – open to walkers, horse riders, and cyclists, way marked with a blue arrow

3. Restricted byway – open to walkers, cyclists, horse riders and horse drawn vehicles, way marked with a plum colored arrow

4. Byway open to all traffic (BOAT) – open to walkers, cyclists, horse riders, horse drawn vehicles and motor vehicles, way marked with a red arrow.[83]

Approximately, 78% of PRoWs are footpaths.[84] The U.K. National Trails highlight the trail's purpose for economic contributions and tourism. The focus of the U.K. National Trails is to establish trails based on the enjoyment of the public, economic benefit, landscape enhancement and public involvement. This system is a great example of a national system for routes and is comparable to the National Trails System in the U.S. The public-private partnerships between the authorities and land owners is a way to manage trails without full reliance on the government. Public-private partnerships would encourage trail users to maintain their trails, which would possibly increase use, enjoyment of the public, environmental enhancement, and visitation. The key elements of

---

[82] Legislation.gov.uk "National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act 1949." (Part IV, Section 52.)
[83] Natural England. "Types of public rights of way" United Kingdom Natural England, (Rights of Way, Types of Public Rights of Way)
[84] Ibid., (Rights of Way, Types of Public Rights of Way)

the U.K. National Trails can be seen in Table 3-4, which highlights the areas concerning

Cultural Routes.

Table 3-4 Summary of Key Elements for United Kingdom National Trails

Key Dates	National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act 1949; Countryside and Rights of Way (CROW) Act 2000
Purpose	contributing to local economies and tourism: through enjoyment, local economic benefit, environmental enhancement, civic engagement
Concepts	Express dedication – where the landowner has given the public a right of use over their land; Presumed dedication – where the public have used a right of way for a longer time than anyone can remember; or Deemed dedication – where a right of way has been in use for 20 years or more; types of Public Rights of Way: footpath, bridleway, restructured byway, byway open to all traffic; long-distance routes
Definition & Examples	Linking existing local footpaths, bridleways, and minor roads, development of new routes in gaps. *Examples* Cleveland Way, Cotswold Way, Hadrian's Wall, Offa's Dyke Path, Pembrokeshire Coast Path, South Downs Way
Criteria	Footpath – open to walkers, way marked with a yellow arrow; Bridleway – open to walkers, horse riders, and cyclists way marked with a blue arrow; Restricted byway – open to walkers, cyclists, horse riders and horse drawn vehicles, way marked with a plum colored arrow; Byway open to all traffic (BOAT) – open to walkers, cyclists, horse riders, horse drawn vehicles and motor vehicles, way marked with a red arrow.
Process	Public-private partnership between local authorities and landowners. Must keep maps of routes updated. Funding through national government: Natural England and Natural Resources Wales, local highway authorities A National Trail Officer or Manager manages and maintains that National Trail according to the nationally agreed standards: co-ordinates maintenance, improvement and promotional work on the ground. Much of the maintenance work is undertaken by the local highway authority together with landowners and, often, with the help of volunteers. Funding for National Trails is provided by national government through Natural England and Natural Resources Wales and also by local highway authorities and other funding partners.

CHAPTER 4

UNITED STATES AND CULTURAL ROUTES

Although a rich discussion has been established noting the approaches to cultural routes by UNESCO, COE, and ICOMOS, and trails by study of the United Kingdom National Trails organization, unfortunately no such discussion exists for cultural routes in the United States. The United States could contribute a broader or altered definition to cultural routes allowing it to establish cultural routes significant to its heritage. Because no definition, criteria, inventory process, or approval process currently exists for cultural routes in the United States, this chapter discusses aspects within the existing United States preservation framework that could potentially be used for the needs of identifying, evaluating, and designating cultural routes in the United States.

The United States has several entities at different levels managing and maintaining preservation efforts. National and federal organizations, laws, and regulations as well as regional, state, and local preservation organizations, laws, and regulations all exist to promote preservation efforts. Two major components of today's preservation framework in the United States were the establishment of the National Trust for Historic Preservation (NTHP) in 1949 and the *National Historic Preservation Act of 1966* (NHPA). These two national preservation actions grounded the disparate preservation efforts of the previous century, allowing the coalescence of regulations and processes for future preservation efforts. There are many areas of preservation in the United States I have researched for this discussion; however, I am only including the

elements I find relevant to cultural routes policy in the United States. Items I considered but did not include are the National Trust for Historic Preservation, the *National Historic Preservation Act of 1966* (with the exception of the National Register of Historic Places), the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, the National Historic Landmarks program, and Traditional Cultural Properties.

When Congress enacted the *National Historic Preservation Act of 1966* (NHPA), it created the National Register of Historic Places (National Register). The National Register is an inventory of historic properties meeting certain criteria in the United States. Currently, there are over 80,000 listings on the National Register, which the National Park Service maintains.[85] The National Register of Historic Places database and State Historic Preservation Offices, maintain information on these listings. Each state oversees the process of survey and review of nominations for properties that are then forwarded to a national office for final review and approval. The NHPA has been improved over time through Congress with some amendments to the original legislation, but it retains most of its basic elements.[86] In order for state and federal levels of the Register to approve a nomination, an applicant provides a detailed description of the property including a narrative statement of its history, context, and historic and architectural significance.

The owner of the property does not need to submit a nomination to be eligible for listing as a National Register property. However, the owner has the right to refuse a designation. If this happens, a property can become "eligible for listing," meaning the property meets the qualifications for being listed in the Register. The Certified Local Governments Program, a preservation partnership between local, state, and national

---

[85] Tyler, Norman, Ted J. Ligibel, and Ilene R. Tyler. *Historic Preservation: An Introduction to Its History, Principles, and Practice*, 2nd ed. New York: W. E. Norton and Company, Inc. 2009, p. 47

[86] Ibid., p. 48

governments with the National Park Service and State Historic Preservation Offices, also

nominates properties for listing in the Register. Norman Tyler describes what the

National Register does in his book, *Historic Preservation:*

- Identifies historically significant buildings, structures, sites, objects, and districts according to the National Register Criteria for Evaluation.
- Encourages the preservation of historic properties by documenting their significance and by lending support to local preservation activities.
- Enables federal, state, and local agencies to consider historic properties in the early stages of planning projects.
- Provides a list identifying historic sites that might be affected by new development for review by the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation.
- Makes owners of historic properties eligible to apply for federal grants-in-aid for preservation activities.
- Encourages the rehabilitation of income-producing historic properties that meet preservation standards through tax incentives; discourages the demolition of income-producing properties through federal income tax disincentives.[87]

Currently, the National Register does not provide any form of protection for listed

properties; the Register lists properties without any legislation protecting them from

alteration or demolition.

Table 4-1 Summary of Key Elements of the National Register of Historic Places

Key Dates	1966 National Historic Preservation Act authorized National Register
Purpose	Official list of the Nation's historic places worthy of preservation. Coordinates and supports public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect America's historic and archeological resources.

---

[87] Tyler, Norman, Ted J. Ligibel, and Ilene R. Tyler. *Historic Preservation: An Introduction to Its History, Principles, and Practice*, 2nd ed. New York: W. E. Norton and Company, Inc. 2009, p. 49

Concepts	A property must meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation: This involves examining the property's age, integrity, and significance. *Age and Integrity* is the property old enough to be considered historic and does it still look much the way it did in the past. *Significance* is the property associated with events, activities, or developments that were important in the past. With the lives of people who were important in the past. With significant architectural history, landscape history, or engineering achievements. Does it have the potential to yield information through archeological investigation about our past.
Definition & Examples	*Examples* Civil Rights Movement in Birmingham, Alabama 1933-1979
Criteria	*Event* the property must make a contribution to the major pattern of American history. *Person* is associated with significant people of the American past. *Design or construction* concerns the distinctive characteristics of the building by its architecture and construction, including having great artistic value or being the work of a master. *Information potential* is satisfied if the property has yielded or may be likely to yield information important to prehistory or history.
Process	Review nominations submitted by states, tribes, and other federal agencies and list eligible properties in the National Register. Offer guidance on evaluating, documenting, and listing different types of historic places through the National Register Bulletin series.

Another form of U.S. heritage preservation is the concept of Heritage Areas, which came about in 1988 with the designation by the National Park Service of America's first Heritage Area-Industrial Heritage Project in Pennsylvania. Congress designated a National Heritage Area as a place with natural, cultural, and historic resources that combine and form a cohesive nationally important landscape.[88] Norman Tyler notes that, in regards to the Pennsylvania project, that:

> The recognition of this diverse and dispersed landscape as a cultural entity was a political and cultural phenomenon that has been recognized for its ability to affect disparate partnerships, including 999 municipalities within 8,000 square miles,

---

[88] National Park Service. "What Are National Heritage Areas?" National Heritage Areas. (What are national heritage areas?)

and for its aggressive application of the Heritage Area concept to achieve
widespread, large-scale preservation, to promote tourism, and to encourage
economic activity.[89]

Congress especially appreciates heritage areas if they feature broad economic impact.

The Alliance of National Heritage Areas is a non-profit organization, established in 1997,

with the purpose of designating Heritage Corridors and Areas. Additionally, Heritage

Areas are one form of "large-scale" preservation encompassing an area of more than one

property or neighborhood.

Table 4-2 Summary of Key Elements of National Heritage Areas

Key Dates	1988 designation of first National Heritage Area-Industrial Heritage Project
Purpose	Grassroots, community-driven approach to heritage conservation and economic development. Supports historic preservation, natural resource conservation, recreation, heritage tourism, and educational projects. Connect local citizens to the preservation and planning process.
Concepts	Tell nationally important stories celebrating our nation's diverse heritage. Lived-in landscapes. Collaborate with communities to determine how to make heritage relevant.
Definition & Examples	Designated by Congress as places where natural, cultural, and historic resources combine into landscape. *Examples* Industrial Heritage Project in Pennsylvania; Mississippi Delta National Heritage Area
Criteria	Must have key elements: landscape must have nationally distinctive natural, cultural, historic, and scenic resources that, when linked together, tell a unique story about our country.
Process	*Designation has both tangible and intangible benefits:* community's pride, history, and traditions, and resident's interest in retaining landscape for future generations and does not compromise control over landscape. Supported through *public-private partnerships.* NPS provides technical, planning, and limited financial assistance to NHAs. *NPS acts as partner and advisor.*

---

[89] Tyler, Norman, Ted J. Ligibel, and Ilene R. Tyler. *Historic Preservation: An Introduction to Its History, Principles, and Practice*, 2nd ed. New York: W. E. Norton and Company, Inc. 2009, p. 334

Although all previous programs discussed can play a role in potentially

influencing a cultural route designation and management process in the United States, the

closest thing resembling a specific approach to cultural routes currently in the United

States is the *National Trails System Act of 1968*, establishing the National Trails System,

which is a network of scenic, historic, and recreational trails. The National Trails System

"provides for outdoor recreation needs, promotes the enjoyment, appreciation, and

preservation of open-air, outdoor areas and historic resources, and encourages public

access and citizen involvement."[90] Although, no comprehensive definition for the term

"trail" exists in the United States, the *National Trails System Act of 1968* defines several

types of national trail systems:

- *National Scenic Trails* – are 100 miles or longer, continuous, primarily non-motorized routes of outstanding recreation opportunity. Such trails are established by an Act of Congress.
- *National Historic Trails* – commemorate historic (and prehistoric) routes of travel that are of significance to the entire Nation. They must meet all three criteria listed in Section 5(b)(11) of the National Trails System Act:
  - It must be a trail or route established by historic use and must be historically significant as a result of that use. It does not currently need to exist, but its location must be known.
  - It must be of national significance with respect to any of several broad facets of American history, such as trade and commerce, exploration, migration and settlement, or military campaigns.
  - It must have significant potential for public recreational use or historical interest based on historic interpretation and appreciation. The potential for such use is generally greater along road-less segments developed as historic trails and at historic sites associated with the trail.
- *National Recreation Trails* – also authorized in the National Trails System Act, are existing regional and local trails recognized by either the Secretary of Agriculture or the Secretary of the Interior upon application.[91]

The responsible parties for the protection and management of national trails are the

National Park Service through the U.S. Department of the Interior and the Forest Service

---

[90] National Park Service. "National Trails System." National Trails System. (The National Trails System is)
[91] *The National Trails System Act*. *U.S. Code*. Vol. 16, secs. 1241-1251 (2009).

through the United States Department of Agriculture. The National Park Service

considers these types of trails, in part or the whole, as a living cultural landscape,

incorporating the tangible elements into the trail systems that make up the entire

intangible theme. This relates to the previous chapters' discussion on tangible and

intangible cultural heritage in the United States.

Table 4-3 Summary of Key Elements of the National Trail System

Key Dates	1968 National Trails System Act
Purpose	Provide for outdoor recreation needs, promote the enjoyment, appreciation, and preservation of open-air outdoor areas and historic resources, and encourage public access and citizen involvement.
Concepts	Linear routes representing long-distance trails and historic trails
Definition & Examples	No comprehensive definition for the term "trail", but there are descriptions of trail systems: Scenic, Historic, and Recreational. These types of trails are living cultural landscapes, incorporating the tangible elements of the trails systems.
Criteria	National Scenic Trails are 100 miles or longer, continuous, primarily non-motorized routes. National Historic Trails commemorate historic routes of travel that are of significance to the entire Nation. National Recreation Trails exist through regional and local trails recognized by either the Secretary of Agriculture or the Secretary of the Interior.
Process	Managed by the National Park Service and the National Forest Service.

As described previously, methods of heritage preservation that include cultural

routes and trails exist on an international level; however, the previously discussed

UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. Trails definitions are not adequate, especially for

younger countries, like the U.S. because they emphasize ancient, long established routes.

Possibilities exist which could broaden the definition of cultural routes. Yet, neither a

definition of cultural routes, nor a cultural route specific designation process allowing for

the identification, designation, or protection of such exists in the United States. Even though no methods currently exist for cultural routes in the United States, this chapter reviewed the United States preservation framework identifying key elements including possible agencies, processes, and criteria that are potentially applicable to address cultural routes. The key elements apply to the implementation process of cultural routes in the U.S. and are outlined in Tables 4-1 through 4-3. These elements provide a strong basis to build a proposal for cultural routes designation and protection in the U.S.

CHAPTER 5

ANALYSIS OF METHODS FOR CULTURAL ROUTES

In Chapter 3, the research discussed the frameworks for identification and designation of cultural routes by three international organizations, UNESCO, COE, and ICOMOS, which focus on shared or common heritage and the United Kingdom National Trails. Chapter 4 discussed the existing United States preservation systems that could relate to a cultural routes definition such as the National Register of Historic Places, the National Trails System and National Heritage Areas. In this chapter, the research will discuss the existing United States preservation framework and how it could adopt elements from UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National Trails to better incorporate cultural routes into the United States framework as a distinct type of resource, one that combines both the built and natural environments. Currently, the United States has a strong preservation system, but it does not encompass all types of people or cultural and heritage resources. Through cultural routes, the United States could expand the breadth of its heritage definition to more robustly include intangible cultural heritage to its existing descriptions for cultural resources.

Cultural routes blend shared heritage over numerous regions and cultures. Routes' common characteristics allow them to serve multiple peoples and interconnect the concepts of tangible and intangible cultural heritage. Moreover, cultural routes illuminate concepts underrepresented in the United States preservation framework, such as minority resources or social movements, which have strongly influenced the United States'

collective identity. UNESCO, COE, and ICOMOS view these routes as a "gestalt,"
meaning the whole of the route is greater than the sum of its parts, implying cultural
routes holistically identify and preserve cultural heritage and resources. This holistic
approach may allow for inclusion of these underrepresented resources in the United
States preservation framework. The United Kingdom National Trails management
framework is a model that the U.S. should consider when including cultural routes in the
U.S. preservation system.

The following analysis looks at two primary groups of information: the essence of
the UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National Trails, and the framework from
UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS and U.K. National Trails that could work within the existing
U.S. preservation system. The first section, *Essence of International cultural routes*, lists
the similarities across frameworks, focusing on the essence of cultural routes and their
identification processes. The second section, *Elements*, looks across frameworks to the
elements applicable to the U.S. system. Both sections look at the issues within the
organizations that would prohibit cultural routes in the U.S.

Essence of International Cultural Routes

Through analysis of Tables 3-1 through 3-4, my research found six overarching
concepts summarizing the essence of the frameworks of cultural routes for UNESCO,
COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National Trails. The concepts are as follows: Multi-Cultural
Values, Breaking Borders, Historic Relationships, Development, Time Frame,
Environment and Setting. The concept of multi-cultural values is seen through the
organizations requiring cross-fertilization of a route, which influences cultural values and

identities as seen through the dynamics a route makes on its path. The following are key

phrases used in each group that reflect multi-cultural values.

Multi-Cultural Values

- A route has cultural characteristics due to the fact it includes cross-cultural aspect or effects.
- Links remote ethnic and cultural groups and fosters their mutual progress through exchange or its capacity to bring together different peoples.
- Promote a journey of heritage through shared cultural heritage.
- Joins communities in an effort to preserve what ideologies they share.
- Cultural range meaning within the regions of the route a common people share influences or evolution of cultural values.
- Influenced by and reflect intercultural exchange between cultures in regards to cross-fertilization of their tangible and intangible.
- Express dedication: giving the public a right to use "private" land.

Breaking Borders

Similar to Multi-Cultural Values, Breaking Borders, means routes involve more than one

culture in their purpose and use. The three organizations agree cultural routes must

exceed the boundaries of one country. Moreover, these organizations specify the terms of

a route must include more than one territory because of its communal nature. As such the

following are key phrases used by each group to reflect breaking borders.

- Highlights exchange and dialogue between countries or regions.
- Specific interactions between groups over and beyond political barriers.
- Interregional themes connecting various regions of Europe.
- Taken to mean a route crossing one or more countries or regions.
- Common heritage breaking national and regional borders.
- Territorial range along local, national, regional, continental, or intercontinental boundaries.
- Values between countries, regions, and continents over time.

Historic Relationships

Historic Relationships suggests that routes follow a historic path. The term relationship

implies the route has a connection with its properties (tangible and intangible values) and

a development of associations of cultures that evolved over time. The following are key

phrases seen in each group's discussion of cultural routes that reflect historic

relationships.

- Spatial characteristics, also known as the length and diversity of a route reflects on the interest of the exchange and the complexity of the links it maintains.
- Historic path the route followed.
- The route's historic sites, monuments, buildings
- Geographic Networks meaning the route consists of towns and cities with a collected common objective or reproduce the archetype.
- Acknowledges properties as part of a whole and demonstrates heritage as a valuable resource.
- Reciprocal cultural influences generate dynamically tangible and intangible values of the route's heritage.
- Having generated heritage values and cultural properties associated to it.
- Demonstrate historic relationships amalgamated from an active arrangement between the peoples and the cultural properties associated with the route.
- Presumed dedication: where the public have used a trail for a longer time than anyone can remember.

Development

The Development of a route does not depend on how the route evolved; rather, it

addresses the development of the cultures connected to the route. Routes address a

transfer of goods and/or knowledge bringing together shared cultural, social, or economic

characteristics. Routes sustain multiple cultures moving beyond the notion of routes as a

simple pathway of communication or transportation. The following are key phrases seen

in each group's discussion of cultural routes that reflect development.

- Events, trade, or migration activities.
- Measured by dynamics generated or favored by commercial, philosophical, religious, transfer of goods, knowledge, and/or know-how.
- Basic necessities for the survival of communities or contributed to their development.
- Bringing common human, cultural, social, geographical, and economic characteristics.
- Sustainable, social, and economic development between multicultural peoples.
- Social, economic, political, and cultural elements.
- Beyond the route's character as a way of communication or transport.

Time Frame

Time Frame acts as a representative for cultural routes, allowing the route's interpretation

to connect to a period when the route held its most significance, even if the period

continues to current use of the route. Hence, the following key phrases reflect time frame

as seen in descriptions of cultural routes by the organizations.

- Temporal characteristics, how long the route exists or existed and the frequency of use.
- The route must have established its identity through diachronic practice over sufficient time.
- Determining the route's beginning, its end, frequency of use, intensity of its use and variations over time.
- Historic pathways meaning the route occurs or occurred during a historic period.
- Routes no longer used and those still developing due to cultural changes over time to determine duration of time the route existed.
- Has been in use for twenty years or more, or longer than anyone can remember.

Environment and Setting

Cultural routes are holistic approaches to heritage, meaning the context in which a single

route's interpretation occurs is just as important as the route itself. The Environment and

Setting concept includes the type of route, whether it is by land or water, and the settings

along the routes, such as towns, landscapes, or environments. As such, the following are

key phrases used by each group to reflect environment and setting.

- The route interacts with the natural environment.
- Associates cultural, natural, and historical aspects combine along the route.
- The route is via land or sea with a modern facet.
- Of the nature and/or scope of the route's range and significance.
- Natural environment be it land, aquatic, mixed, or other setting.
- Contact its natural and cultural setting, environmental value, relationships to landscape.
- Footpath, bridleway, restricted byway, byway open to all traffic.

The six concepts (Multi-Cultural Values, Break Borders, Historic Relationship,

Development, Time Frame, and Environment and Setting) summarize fundamental

values of cultural routes as seen through UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National

Trails. UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K National Trails discourse on cultural routes

and concepts will be essential in my proposed approach for the United States' to take

regarding cultural routes. However, there are areas that UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and

U.K. National Trails do not address. The organizations focus on ancient routes, which

significantly limits eligible routes in the United States if that criteria is used. By focusing

on historic routes and military parades, the international discourse to date lacks inclusion

of topics such as political and social progressive efforts, which are more applicable to

nations with a shorter history, such as the United States, and might include routes, such as

a blues trail, Run Away Slave Routes, or Sherman's March to the Sea.

<div align="center">Methodological Elements of Cultural Routes</div>

The previous section discusses the fundamental concepts that express a cultural

route. This section compares the existing frameworks and methods used by UNESCO,

COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National Trails and the existing U.S. programs to determine

what methodological elements might be most effective for implementation of cultural

routes in the current U.S. preservation framework. This analysis compares the various

program's purpose, concepts, definition and examples, criteria, and processes. As a result

of this analysis, I identified key methods and practices that can potentially work within

the existing United States' preservation framework.

<div align="center">*Purpose*</div>

In reflecting on the purpose of each of the seven programs, it became clear that

one primary focus was to improve knowledge of heritage through economic, social, and

philosophical experiences. The programs intended to promote shared cultural heritage

through experiencing the journey of the route. Heritage is demonstrated through the
social and economic resources along the route. Cultural routes bring together natural,
cultural, and historical settings into a greater and broader notion. Ultimately, across all
programs' purposes they combine significant tangible resources with intangible cultural
heritage. Table 5-1 highlights the purpose of each program, with terms and phrases
bolded to reveal commonalities.

Table 5-1 Purpose

UNESCO	The nature of the concept is open, dynamic, and evocative. Striving to **improve the recognition within heritage of the economic, social, symbolic, and philosophical dimensions and constant and countless interactions with the natural environment in all its diversity.** They are rich and fertile resources that offer a privileged framework and approach to ones history. They are identified because of its strengths, tangible elements, and the significance of the route as a whole.
COE	**promote journey through shared cultural heritage**; contain fundamental principle of the COE: human rights, cultural democracy, cultural diversity and identity, dialogue, mutual exchange and enrichment across boundaries and centuries
ICOMOS	introduced a new ethic of conservation that considers properties and sites as a common heritage that breaks national and regional borders and joins communities in an effort to preserve what ideologies they share; acknowledges properties as part of a whole and **demonstrates heritage as a valuable resource for sustainable social and economic development** between multicultural; **helps to associate natural, cultural, and historical settings into a large dynamic that recognizes heritage as a much broader and intricate concept**
United Kingdom National Trails	Contribute to local economies and tourism **through enjoyment**, local **economic benefit, environmental enhancement**, and **civic engagement**
National Register of Historic Places	Official list of the Nation's **historic places worthy of preservation**. Coordinates and supports public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect America's historic and archeological resources.

National Heritage Areas	Grassroots, community-driven approach to **heritage conservation and economic development**. Supports historic preservation, natural resource conservation, recreation, heritage tourism, and educational projects. **Connect local citizens to the preservation** and planning process.
National Trails System	Provide for outdoor recreation needs**, promote the enjoyment, appreciation**, and preservation of open-air outdoor areas and historic resources, and encourage public access and citizen involvement.

Concepts

In assessing each program's concept it became clear that cultural routes promote the exchange of ideas through the sum of their elements. Routes have multiple layers adding and emerging over time with multiple cultures and values encountered and exchanged. Routes are part of national history, memory, or heritage and exhibit historic relationships through the movements and exchanges of goods, ideas, and values. Nationally important stories are presented through the linear routes that express the diverse heritage of the United States. Table 5-2 emphasizes in bold text that commonality of concepts across all the analyzed programs.

Table 5-2 Concepts

UNESCO	Based on the **dynamics of movement and the idea of exchanges** with continuity in space and time. Refers to a whole **- where the route has a worth over and above the sum of the elements** and through which it gains its cultural significance. Highlights exchange and dialogue between countries or regions. Is **multi-dimensional with different aspects developing and adding to its prime purpose** which may be religious, commercial, administrative or otherwise**. Tangible elements, holistic, authentic elements, duration, current use, people affected, intangible and symbolic**

COE	Routes must **demonstrate European values that are shared between several countries**. Experts from various regions and in multiple fields must research the route's themes to guarantee equal exposure for all of the peoples that occupy the route. Must reflect some **part of European history, memory, or heritage** and add to the interpretation of modern Europe. Engage young people's educational and cultural interactions with the sites and therefore align with the COE's matter for those fields. Must allow for development and pioneering projects that **address cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development**, involving things such as the Green Movement into our preservation practices. Must consider and allow long-term multidisciplinary project through networks in the COE
ICOMOS	Must have **developed from movements of people** as well as a continuous **exchange of goods or idea, knowledge, and values between** countries, regions, and continents over time. Influenced by and reflect the intercultural exchange between cultures in regards to the **cross-fertilization of their tangible and intangible cultural heritage;** must **demonstrate the historic relationships** that have amalgamated from an active arrangement between the peoples as well as the cultural properties associated with the route
United Kingdom National Trails	**Express dedication** – where the landowner has given the public a right of use over their land; **Presumed dedication** – where the public have used a right of way for a longer time than anyone can remember; **or Deemed dedication** – where a right of way has been in use for 20 years or more; types of Public Rights of Way: **footpath, bridleway, restructured byway, byway open to all traffic; long-distance routes**
National Heritage Areas	*Eligibility*: Ensuring the entity under consideration is a property. Considering the property's **integrity. Evaluating** the property with reference to the National Register criteria. Determining whether any of the National Register criteria considerations make the property ineligible.
National Trails System	**Tell nationally important stories celebrating our nation's diverse heritage.** Lived-in landscapes. Collaborate with communities to determine how to make heritage relevant. **Linear routes representing long-distance trails and historic trails**

Definition and Examples

The multiple program review revealed cultural routes are based around themes,

such as historical, artistic, and/or social interests. The combination of tangible and

intangible resources promotes the cultural exchange found through routes. Similar to the

COE and European Cultural Routes, American cultural routes should reflect aspects of American history and society. ICOMOS-recognized cultural routes combine natural, cultural, and historic resources, as should cultural routes in the United States, allowing for a thorough interpretation of routes. U.S. National Historic Trails commemorate historic routes of travel, as do UNESCO, ICOMOS, COE, and U.K. National Trails. This historic aspect is important to the interpretation of cultural routes, yet the definition of historic may need to be broadened for the ever-evolving nature of the United States. For instance, a blues trail commemorates a culturally significant movement in American history but does not take place on a route historically used for travel - it traces a significant path of culture instead.

Table 5-3	Definition	Examples
UNESCO	Routes combine exchanges and journeys and exclude those limited to physical way used for travelling. There are **four characteristics of routes: Spatial, Temporal, Cultural, Role or Purpose**. Routes recognize and protect aspects of specific interactions between human groups over and beyond political barriers. Indirect subsequent products which often have had more important cultural consequences.	religious, events, trade activities, military campaigns, sports events
COE	the term European Cultural Route is taken to mean a route crossing one or two more countries or regions, **organized around themes that are historical, artistic, or social interest is patently European,** either by virtue of the geographical route followed or because of the nature and/or scope of its range and significance -- application of the term European to a route must imply a significance and cultural dimension which is more than merely local. the route must be based on a number of highlights, with places particularly rich in historical associations, which are also representative of European culture as a whole	pilgrim pathways, silk, monastic, cities and discoveries, Gypsy, fortified military

ICOMOS	its existence and significance can only be explained by its specific purpose throughout a long period of history and by having generated heritage values and cultural properties associated to it reflecting reciprocal influences between different cultural groups as a result of its own peculiar dynamics; developed from **movements of people and continuous exchange of ideas, knowledge, and values**; influenced by and reflect **intercultural exchange** between cultures in regards to **cross-fertilization of their tangible and intangible**, demonstrate **historic relationships** that have amalgamated from an active arrangement between the peoples as well as the cultural properties associated with the route	Santiago de Compostela, silk, Roman, Incan, trade caravan
United Kingdom National Trails	Linking **existing local footpaths, bridleways, and minor roads**, development of new routes in gaps.	Hadrian's Wall, Offa's Dyke Path, Pembrokeshire Coast Path, South Downs Way
National Register of Historic Places	Lists **national, regional, state, and local resources** worthy of preservation.	Civil Rights Movement in Birmingham, Alabama 1933-1979
National Heritage Areas	Designated by Congress as places where **natural, cultural, and historic resources combine** into landscape.	Industrial Heritage Project in Pennsylvania
National Trails System	National Scenic Trails are 100 miles or longer, continuous, primarily non-motorized routes. **National Historic Trails commemorate historic routes of travel that are of significance to the entire nation.** National Recreation Trails exist through regional and local trails recognized by either the Secretary of Agriculture or the Secretary of the Interior.	Lewis and Clark National Historic Trail

Criteria

Criteria becomes one of the lynch pins in trying to determine how other programs pose what is "in" and what is "out." Studying this aspect for application to the U.S. system was quite revealing. First, cultural routes are similar to other historic resources

because of their time, use, and symbolic significance. Routes are unique because they

look at heritage resources from a different perspective because they create geographic

and cultural networks by considering their linear configuration and their interaction with

the natural environment. Further, some programs focused on significance because of their

association with events, people, and the role it played in the history of a place. Finally, it

was seen that cultural routes must tell a unique story about a region or place. Table 5-4

summarizes the criteria for each studied program highlighting similar terms or phrases in

bold.

Table 5-4 Criteria

UNESCO	route can be measured by dynamics (commercial, philosophical, religious) which it may have generated or favored **(transfer of goods, knowledge, know-how**) and by the **symbolic significance it represents for anyone using it** (or for anyone who may have used it, or for anyone referring to it). It is consisting of materials, cultural and spiritual routes**, tangible and intangible combinations, culture and nature**. **Spatial characteristics:** the length and diversity of a route; exchange and the complexity of the links that it maintains. **Temporal characteristics:** how long it has been in existence and the frequency of use; established its identity through diachronic practice over sufficient time. **Cultural characteristics:** cross-cultural aspect or effects; **it links remote ethnic and cultural groups and fosters their mutual progress through exchange or its capacity to bring together different peoples**. **Role or Purpose:** has been used to exchange spiritual good, religious or philosophical, or basic necessities for the survival of communities or has contributed to their development such as trade in foodstuffs, minerals, manufacture goods and more

COE	themes: categorized under peoples, migrations and the spread of the major European philosophical, religious, artistic, scientific, technical, and commercial movement -- concepts 1. **historic pathways**, occur during a historic period such as a pilgrim way, and trade or migration routes via land or sea, modern facet 2. **circuit and route**, interregional themes because they connect various regions of Europe, bringing common human, cultural, social, geographical, and economic characteristics predating current national borders 3. **geographic networks**, consist of towns and cities that have a collected common objective or are networks that reproduce the archetype such as monasteries 4. **cultural network**, represents the creativity, skills, and training learned through cultural and artistic exchanges and practices
ICOMOS	Categories: **Territorial Range**, **Cultural Range** shared influences, or evolution of cultural values. **Goal and Function** social, economic, political, or cultural elements. **Duration of Time** routes that are no longer used and those still developing due to cultural changes over time. **Structural Configuration**, linear, circular, radial or network. **Natural Environment** land, aquatic, mixed, or other setting. Functionality to serve a concrete and well-determined purpose; tangible and intangible values of its heritage dynamically generated as a result of reciprocal cultural influences; its structural configuration; its whole geographic and historic context its natural and cultural setting, whether the latter is urban or rural, environmental value, relationships to landscape, duration in time, symbolic and spiritual dimension
United Kingdom National Trails	**Footpath** – open to walkers, way marked with a yellow arrow. **Bridleway** – open to walkers, horse riders, and cyclists way marked with a blue arrow. **Restricted byway** – open to walkers, cyclists, horse riders and horse drawn vehicles, way marked with a plum colored arrow. **Byway open to all traffic (BOAT)** – open to walkers, cyclists, horse riders, horse drawn vehicles and motor vehicles, way marked with a red arrow.
National Register of Historic Places	**Event,** the property must make a contribution to the major pattern of American history. **Person** is associated with significant people of the American past. **Design or construction** concerns the distinctive characteristics of the building by its architecture and construction, including having great artistic value or being the work of a master. **Information potential** is satisfied if the property has yielded or may be likely to yield information important to prehistory or history.
National Heritage Areas	Must have key elements: landscape must have nationally **distinctive natural, cultural, historic, and scenic resources** that, when linked together, **tell a unique story about our country**.

National Trails System	National Scenic Trails are 100 miles or longer, continuous, primarily non-motorized routes. National Historic Trails **commemorate historic routes of travel that are of significance to the entire Nation**. National Recreation Trails exist regional and local trails recognized by either the Secretary of Agriculture or the Secretary of the Interior.

Designation Process

The final comparison reviewed each program's designation process. Strategies to use from other programs are set processes for identification, definition, and inventory. The COE uses two methods to manage cultural routes in Europe: the certification for cultural routes and the independent governing body. These methods would aid with the amount of cultural routes in the United States during the designation process. A designation process would also define and regulate partnerships, such as working with the National Park Service (NPS). The U.K. National Trails management processes are a partnership between local communities and the government or governing body. This method would put less pressure on the NPS to designate and manage the cultural resources if the partnering agencies contributed to the management. Table 5-5 notes the common elements in the designation process for each program reviewed.

Table 5-5 Designation Process

UNESCO	**Identification**: accurately identified for protection and development concerns. **Definition:** thorough description of what could qualify for designation. **Inventory**: organized on a regional basis, application process/multi-regional, approved by each area, region, and country that the route passes through (ownership of routes). **Spatial**: path the route followed; its sites, monuments, buildings. **Temporal:** over route's beginning, its end, frequency of use, intensity of its use and variations. **Cultural Criteria:** impact of the route, limitations, and meaning regarding type of exchange that the route was created for.

COE	**Designation** - rules and procedures. Is suggested by member states, local or regional authorities, project initiators, or COE Secretariat. **Certified** "Cultural Route of the Council of Europe". **Theme** representative of European values, follow **historic route or newly created route**, acknowledge and practice long-term multilateral co-operation project, be **manage by an independent or organized network (COE governing body, European Institute of Cultural Routes**)
ICOMOS	**Defines, Regulates and Establishes Criteria**. **Identification**: looks at the **tangible and intangible ideals of any route's cultural heritage** which are defined in order to establish the functional purpose of a cultural route. **Integrity**: demonstrating evidence of integrity through **physical and intangible remnants**. **Authenticity**: continue to maintain its representation of the **historic function or purpose**, evident in the natural and cultural context of each stretch of the route. **Methodologies for research: assessment, protection, preservation, conservation, use, and management**
United Kingdom National Trails	**Public-private partnership between local authorities and landowners**. Must keep maps of routes updated. **National Trails Officer or Manager manages and maintains**: improvement and promotion. **Funding through national government**: Natural England and Natural Resources Wales, local highway authorities
National Register of Historic Places	**Review nominations** submitted by states, tribes, federal agencies and the general public and list eligible properties in the National Register. Offer guidance on evaluating, documenting, and listing different types of historic places through the National Register Bulletin series.
National Heritage Areas	**Designation has both tangible and intangible benefits:** community's pride, history, and traditions, and resident's interest in retaining landscape for future generations and does not compromise control over landscape. Supported through **public-private partnerships.** NPS provides technical, planning and limited financial assistance to NHAs. **NPS acts as partner and advisor.**
National Trails System	**Managed by the National Park Service and National Forest Service**.

Analysis of the UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National Trails programs

demonstrate viable strategies for the United States to create and accept cultural routes as

a significant resource type worthy of preservation. The opportunities the various program

guidelines evoke is a plethora of heritage concepts for the United States to represent through its own cultural routes. Moreover, the designation of cultural routes allows the United States to explore from a different perspective forms of cultural heritage not currently protected. The analysis of existing United States preservation programs demonstrated the potential for cultural routes to be incorporated into the United States framework as it already exists. By adding to the existing framework, cultural routes can become a new form of protected heritage. The lack of a process for cultural route designation in the United States is the primary issue. By using several case studies, the next chapter explores a proposed approach for acknowledgment of cultural routes as a heritage resource in the United States through: purpose, concepts, proposed processes, definition, criteria for routes, and a designation process.

CHAPTER 6

PROPOSED APPROACH FOR U.S. CULTURAL ROUTES

Having examined the international cultural heritage categories of UNESCO,

COE, ICOMOS, the U.K. National Trails, and the current preservation system and

programs in the United States, there exists a resolved list of recommendations to pursue

acknowledgment of cultural routes as heritage resources in the United States. The

recommendations consist of a proposed purpose, concept, definition and examples,

criteria, and designation process. These recommendations stem from the efforts of

cultural route programs in other countries with the addition of missing aspects that would

create a perspective for cultural routes as heritage resources in the United States. Using

several case studies to define the underlying context of cultural routes, this chapter will

discuss and recommend a purpose, concept, definition with examples, criteria, and

designation process.

Context for Cultural Routes in the United States

When thinking about heritage or cultural routes, one naturally assumes a pathway

unified by physical elements. However, this thesis proposes that tangible components

determine cultural routes, and routes themselves consist of the intangible. Playing a larger

societal role, cultural routes facilitate the interlacing of personal and social dynamics

from the larger society. Moreover, cultural routes present intangible cultural heritage

because of their ability to communicate these explicit occurrences of peoples in the

United States. Cultural routes can represent social movements, political strides, historic

roads, or cultural phenomenon that are shared and experienced amongst peoples. Cultural routes contain social evolution articulated through intangible and tangible routes or sites occupying partial pre-existing roads, allowing them to become a vehicle to communicate the movement and demonstrate its significance in our cultural heritage. The ideas of roads, linear paths, or cultural landscapes are significant to the identities of all cultural routes. However, these ideas are only half of the whole. This is where the existing systems and programs of international organizations and the United States differ. The international organizations consistently argue that a cultural route is derived from its combination of tangible and intangible elements, whereas the existing preservation system in the United States focuses on the physical path, route, or remnants. The United States does not acknowledge through legislation or application that intangible elements are the significance behind these paths that allow for cultural routes, that the individual tangible elements provide the pieces that unify the intangible whole.

One significant difference between the concept of U.S. cultural routes and U.S. National Historic Trails is the identification of intangible characteristics. U.S. National Historic Trails designation currently requires that the path meet three criteria: be established by historic use and be historically significant; fit a broad facet of national significance, such as trade and commerce, exploration, migration, and settlement; and have potential for public use. Two potential cultural routes that are already considered National Historic Trails and that fit this description are the Natchez Trace National Scenic Trail and the Lewis and Clark National Historic Trail. These are historically significant and have a historic use and broad theme, which abides by the National Historic Trails definition. However, additional examples of historically significant trails

with intangible heritage aspects not currently listed as National Historic Trails are the Blues Routes, Run Away Slave Routes, or Sherman's March to the Sea. These trails are historically significant but are limited by their period of use, intangible elements, and broad theme. One could argue that Run Away Slave Routes or Trail of Tears fits the migration theme, but forced migration, rather than removal from one's property, for freedom is more of a political and social regression. The Blues Route is an example of social and cultural evolution and a short period of use, aspects that do not fulfill current criteria for the U.S. National Historic Trails recognition, even though the route is historically significant in African American cultural identity.

Purpose

With this context in mind, cultural routes begin to form a larger purpose. For the United States, cultural routes acknowledge heritage of economics, social and symbolic representation, philosophical proportions, and continuous and numerous exchanges with the natural environment. Cultural routes express cultural heritage through experiences of journey and exploration. Routes demonstrate heritage as a valuable resource for sustainable social and economic development. They help associate natural, cultural, and historic settings into an effect, recognizing heritage as a much broader and intricate concept. Another purpose of cultural routes is to preserve them as nationally significant historic resources. Differing from U.S. National Historic Trails, cultural routes identify intangible cultural heritage and ethnic traditions and ethnic cultural heritage. With the combination of tangible and intangible cultural heritage, cultural routes can support historic preservation, heritage tourism, educational projects, and connection with citizens.

Concepts

Cultural routes consist of significant exchanges of movements and ideas. Valued holistically and at a broader significance worth more than the sum of its elements, routes are multi-dimensional with various aspects evolving from and adding to its main purpose. Cultural routes comprise the symbolic, tangible, and intangible elements of a society. Authentic to their purpose and the people affected by them, routes exist through the duration of their use, short or long. Cultural routes demonstrate American values as a part of the country's history, memory, and heritage. The route, and elements of the route, engage educational aspects and cultural interactions. A United States designation of a route signifies cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development along the path, therefore aiding communities along the path much like the U.K. National Trails encourages economic contribution and tourism. Cultural routes develop, forming movement of peoples or exchanges of goods, ideas, knowledge, and values shared between the regions or states. Routes must signify an event or person(s) associated with the route. In addition, the route is a location with a strong association to the event and the nation's history. Emphasizing the concept of exchange of ideas and knowledge, cultural routes can tell important stories that celebrate our nation's diverse heritage, as a reflection of social movements in United States history.

Definition and Examples

Historical, artistic, and/or social interest themes define American cultural routes. A route's existence and significance through its specific purpose, which includes an exchange of ideas and values of peoples, define cultural routes, such as the Selma to Montgomery March. Routes represent a mixture of tangible and intangible cultural

heritage, exhibiting the historic relationships associated with the route. One defines

cultural routes by their spatial representation, duration and use, cultural network, and a

unique purpose. Cultural routes represent an outstanding aspect of American history and

culture, such as oppressed peoples' social movements through natural, cultural, and

historic resources. Examples of cultural routes would be the Lewis and Clark National

Historic Trail, Blues Route, Run Away Slaves Routes, or Sherman's March to the Sea.

Criteria

Routes link distant ethnic and cultural groups and foster their mutual progress

through exchange. A cultural route has the capacity to bring together diverse peoples.

Cultural routes follow historic pathways, circuits, geographic networks, or cultural and

social networks. Additionally, they have a physical function covering the route's social,

economic, political, and cultural elements. Cultural routes follow criteria by territory, use,

development and function, or natural environment. They have the strongest association

with a significant event or role in history, such as the social evolution of oppressed

cultures in America, like the Underground Railroad, which gave slaves the chance of

freedom. Cultural routes reflect cultural traditions and values by effected peoples, as well

as eligibility for listing in the National Register of Historic Places or listing in their own

category for American Cultural Routes.

Designation Process

In order to acknowledge cultural routes as heritage resources in the United States,

there needs to be a clear designation process. The process will define and identify cultural

routes based on the aforementioned concepts, definition, and criteria. My proposal is for

cultural routes to be a subset of the National Trails System. Existing national trails

include scenic trails, historic trails, and recreational trails; cultural routes would be a fourth category. An alternative proposal to joining the U.S. National Trails System is for legislation to be passed acknowledging cultural routes as a separate entity from the National Trails System and National Heritage Areas, like a National Cultural Routes Act. Using the United Kingdom National Trails program model, the United States would collaborate with state organizations that would manage and maintain cultural routes like the Department of Transportation, thus allowing for American Cultural Routes to be their own separate entity of cultural heritage. The preexisting partnership between the National Park Service and the National Trails System is a good example. The National Park Service would continue to act as an administrator and advisor for cultural routes while working with state trail administrators, such as the Department of Transportation. Cultural routes would need an application or proposal process, like the United Kingdom's National Trails or the United States' National Trails System.

The proposal would follow the aforementioned recommendations for purpose, concepts, definition, and criteria. Like the United Kingdom's National Trails, cultural routes would be supported through public-private partnerships between these national organizations and the communities affected by the routes' designations, such as a state Department of Transportation. The identification process will look at the integrity and authenticity of the route, meaning "the ability of a property to convey its significance."[92] The tangible and intangible interrelationship of the route will be explained during the identification process as well. The National Park Service will identify a cultural route once the proposal is approved. The National Register could include a subset list regarding

---

[92] National Park Service. "How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation." *National Register Bulletin* no. 15, p. 44

intangible cultural heritage in the United States and include cultural routes as part of the intangible cultural heritage list. Similar to a National Landmarks designation, a route will be designated as a "Certified Cultural Route of the National Register." Alternatively, the creation of an American Cultural Routes list similar to that of the National Trails System list could act as the database for cultural routes. Additionally, the National Trails System and Department of Transportation would use preservation methods and protection methods similar to the existing methods used for current trails and the United Kingdom's National Trails, while managing and maintaining cultural routes through public-private partnerships, such as the Georgia Department of Transportation working with the communities in which Sherman's March to the Sea occurs. An inventory process managed by the National Trails System will maintain up-to-date information on the routes and any proposed information and continuing developments regarding the route.

The essence of cultural routes, listed in Chapter 5, is seen in the proposal for United States cultural routes. A cultural route considers *multi-cultural values* because it looks at the evolution of the American peoples and identities. A route *breaks borders* between states and regions connecting the collective American people. Routes are reflective of *historic relationships* and *time frame* because of their association with American social evolution and the time periods affiliated within the movements. The *development* of a cultural route is seen through the connection of multiple cultures, identities, and characteristics now identifying the American people. *Environment and Setting* focus on the natural, cultural, and historic relationships of cultural routes. Along with an interest in representing more peoples and intangible heritage through preservation in the United States, the frameworks and program elements found within these agencies

and programs led to a proposal for establishing cultural routes in the United States. This

proposed approach to cultural routes in the United States is seen in Table 6-1, Proposed

Acknowledgement of Cultural Routes as heritage resources in the United States.

Table 6-1: Proposed Acknowledgement of Cultural Routes as Heritage Resources in the United States

Purpose	Cultural Routes will improve recognition within heritage of the economic, social, symbolic, and philosophical dimensions and constant and countless interactions with the natural environment. Promote journey of heritage through shared Nation's cultural heritage. Resource for sustainable social and economic development between multicultural relationships in the United States. Helps to associate natural, cultural, and historical settings into a much broader and intricate concept. Preserve historic resources and encourage public access and citizen involvement. Demonstrate the collective and shared heritage that has aided in the evolution of the United States' social history.
Concepts	There are dynamics of movements. Multi-dimensional with different aspects developing and adding to the prime purpose. Must demonstrate American values and be part of American history and heritage. Routes address cultural tourism. Developed from social movements of people and social or intangible heritage through an exchange of ideas, knowledge, or values. Show a combination of tangible and intangible cultural heritage. Routes are significant to an event, person, or social movement and demonstrate a strong association of significant elements that occurred during such a movement.
Definition & Examples	Routes are organized around themes that are historical, or of social and intangible interest to the United States. Their existence is due to their social and historical significance. Eligible for inclusion in the National Trails System and listings in the National Register as a Cultural Route because of its association with cultural practices and social or historical developments of American values, struggles, and characteristics. American Cultural Route list/ separate entity. Must be rooted in American history. *Examples* Lewis and Clark Trail National Historic Trail, Blues Route, Run Away Slave Routes, or Sherman's March to the Sea.

Criteria	Has symbolic significance for anyone using the route. It is a combination of tangible and intangible, cultural and natural. It links remote ethnic and cultural groups and fosters their mutual progress through exchange and social developments. Can be historic pathways, circuit, or geographic networks. Must have age, integrity, and significance. Be associated with events, activities, or development of American history. Eligible for the U.S. National Trails System and listing on the National Register within the new cultural routes and intangible cultural heritage definitions recommended in this thesis.
Process	Identification, definition, inventory, and interpretation. Designation as a new type into the National Trails System. Eligible for listing on the National Register under an Intangible Cultural Heritage List or American Cultural Routes list. Create a United States Cultural Routes certification similar to "landmarks" designation. Administered by the National Park Service. Managed and maintain through partnership with the National Trails System, state Departments of Transportation, and communities the route passes through. Can be designated based on national/multi-dimensional significance. Creation of National Cultural Routes Act allowing for cultural routes to act as their own separate entity like the National Trails System

Case Studies of Proposed Cultural Routes

To further articulate cultural routes that could meet the proposed cultural route designation, I offer here three potential cultural routes in the United States: the Southern Blues Route, Run Away Slaves Route, and Sherman's March to the Sea. These routes are examples of the kinds of tangible and intangible relations cultural routes have and could be designated through the proposed enhancement to the U.S. National Trails System. However, they currently have no course for preservation in the United States.

Southern Blues Route

The Southern Blues Route would follow the path of the musical movement in the United States. Blues is a genre of music that was created by African-American communities in the southern part of the United States during the early twentieth century.

Paul Oliver wrote in his book, *The Story of the Blues,* that "Blues is music and blues is song; blues singers are people. Blues is not text and blues singers are not pictures. But they aren't discs of shellac or vinyl either. As the disembodied voice that struggled to be heard above the needle-scratch of old records may give some impression of the sounds of the blues."[93] Blues was a movement of the soul and it was a movement found in African American communities as a way of expression. The Southern Blues Route would follow one course of Blues music through the southern United States starting in New Orleans, Louisiana, to Jackson, Mississippi, Florence, Alabama, Memphis, Tennessee, and Nashville, Tennessee. This route would have significant stops in cities that influenced this cultural movement. The Southern Blues Route would demonstrate values of African Americans at the time of the Blues movement through these social and intangible elements. There is a clear connection between the Blues movement and social heritage. There are several geographic networks linking the Blues culture to one another across the United States. The combination of tangible and intangible elements link ethnic and cultural groups through social developments as per criteria of a proposed cultural route. The Southern Blues Route is just one possible cultural route found in the United States that lacks any clear designation or preservation process currently.

<div align="center">

Runaway Slaves Route

</div>

The Runaway Slaves Routes would follow paths that slaves took on their way to freedom. These paths were networks that runaway slaves would take as part of the Underground Railroad. This example will only focus on a singular route because there are so many. The northern routes might include Cincinnati, Ohio, Buffalo, New York, Annapolis, Maryland, New York City, New York, and Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. The

---

[93] Oliver, Paul. *The Story of the Blues*. Dexter, Michigan: Northeastern University Press, 1998.

route helps associate the natural areas used by runaway slaves to the social and cultural events they endured for freedom. The Runaway Slaves Routes would demonstrate the social ills, knowledge, and values that were placed on these unwilling peoples forced into a certain way of life. These routes are a way to interpret a tragic part of American culture and history.

Sherman's March to the Sea

General Sherman led 60,000 soldiers from Atlanta, Georgia to Savannah, Georgia on a march to the sea. The soldiers stole food and livestock, all while burning houses and barns of those who stood in their way. Sherman split his troops into two, having one head into Tennessee and Alabama while the other was on a march to the Atlantic Ocean. The march included an attack on Atlanta, Georgia. Sherman attacked Atlanta because it was an industrial and railroad center for the South. Atlanta supplied the South with food, weapons, and other items during the Civil War. The Union soldiers took all of the supplies they could manage. Sherman's March to the Sea demonstrates various economic, social, and philosophical scopes throughout the Civil War. These multidimensional aspects found during the Civil War on either the Confederacy or Union sides are seen through the March: soldiers, families, towns, and ethics. Sherman's March to the Sea is a combination of tangible and intangible culture that follows a historic pathway from Atlanta to Savannah, Georgia, perfectly fitting the proposed criteria for cultural routes in the United States. This chapter expresses the proposed changes or additions to existing cultural routes definitions. These three examples of cultural routes are just a few of the many existing cultural routes found in the United States.

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

Cultural heritage encompasses tangible and intangible forms of resources such as knowledge, behaviors, relationships, or materials. Typically, tangible remnants are evidence to these cultural identities, but what about the intangible elements. Within the last several years, protecting intangible cultural heritage has become a topic of interest in the preservation field. Cultural heritage preservation has evolved from maintaining tangible resources to understanding, and recalling the intangible aspects of a culture's identity, thus moving preservation from the focus of tangible aspects to the combination of tangible and intangible cultural resources. In 1982, a resolution that came from the World Conference on Cultural Policies in Mexico City stated that preservation of the intangible needed to be addressed, defining intangible as an incomparable worth because of its unique identity, culture, and customs. In 1989, UNESCO adopted the Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore, which put in place the first legislation regarding intangible cultural heritage.

Cultural routes propagate more than mere trade, communication, and migration. Cultural routes are an amalgamation of tangible and intangible heritage, consisting of physical routes that lead people across nations and intangible processes defining cultural identity. Intangible resources guide societies, movements, religion, peoples, and the individuals through change of the mind, character, ethics, and experience. In 1993, UNESCO listed the Pilgrim's Route to Santiago de Compostela as a World Heritage Site. Afterwards, UNESCO's World Heritage Committee Board approved the discussion of

cultural routes based on their vibrant and provocative characteristics with aspects of social, economic, and natural diversity. In 2010, the Council of Europe implemented a resolution bringing European states together to develop European cultural routes in order to preserve the resource. Unlike UNESCO's authority over cultural routes listed as World Heritage Sites, the COE created a separate entity to govern cultural routes called the European Institute of Cultural Routes.

The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes was established in 2008. With the Charter on Cultural Routes, ICOMOS redefined aspects of cultural properties and cultural heritage, addressing definition, purpose, context, setting, and more regarding cultural routes as a cultural heritage resource. ICOMOS asserts that cultural routes consider properties as shared or common heritage that join communities in preserving shared ideologies. Cultural routes move people in waves of social developments, interlacing a society's history and its stories. Intangible aspects of cultural heritage resources form a piece of the foundation for understanding cultural routes. ICOMOS emphasizes that the authenticity of a cultural routes is an essential source of the route and that the credibility of elements is demonstrated through the natural and cultural settings as well as the tangible and intangible elements. The United Kingdom National Trails emphasizes the trail's purpose for economic contributions and tourism. The U.S. National Trails focus on public enjoyment, environmental enhancement, public involvement, and economic benefit. The local authorities, landowners, and occupiers of the trails join in a public-private partnership. The partnerships manage and maintain the National Trails through investigations and maps. This partnership can encourage visitation, public involvement, and possibly increased use.

Although world cultures, UNESCO, COE, ICOMOS, and U.K. National Trails recognized cultural routes as early as the 1980s through designation mechanisms, the United States does not participate in acknowledging cultural routes according to these international standards. A U.S. cultural route could broaden or alter the current international standards allowing the U.S. to establish cultural routes as a significant form of cultural heritage. The international standards assert that a cultural route is derived from its tangible and intangible aspects, but the existing U.S. preservation programs focus on the tangible elements like the path, route, or remnants. Through legislation, the U.S. does not acknowledge the significance of intangible heritage, which would allow for cultural routes in the U.S. The research here demonstrates the potential of United States cultural route designation and justifies a much-needed process that will influence American economics and tourism.

Through research of the existing international standards, my proposed approach is able to alter a definition for potential cultural routes in the U.S. The existing processes and mechanisms used to guide a U.S. proposal consisted of analyzing UNESCO, ICOMOS, COE, U.K. National Trails, National Register of Historic Places, National Trails System, and National Heritage Areas. My proposed approach to acknowledging cultural routes as heritage resources in the U.S. focuses on a modern interpretation of American history within the United States' social movements. These routes forge the American identity by factoring in history, natural resources, and the built environment. Cultural routes are the intersection of these aspects and resources, as they express modern American history along its tangible and intangible resources, shaping the lives of its people.

Cultural Routes allow people to experience journeys beyond the simple physical sense by engaging peoples in intangible heritage through identity, ethics, and history. Connecting people with their intangible heritage leads them to a better understanding of the historical context of which they are a part. Cultural routes broaden people's awareness of a society's past, allowing the acknowledgement to teach meanings beyond the physical boundaries. The research here demonstrates a journey that does not exist as a stagnant entity in the physical plane, but instead evolves as the people of a society move along, shaping the route into a living landscape. Adopting this holistic concept along with the criteria set forth by leading worldwide organizations, the United States will embrace its responsibilities to honor its own people by designating routes defining the content of its character.

REFERENCES

 "Culture." UNESCO, Culture, themes.
  http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/movable-heritage-and-museums/unesco-database-of-national-cultural-heritage-laws/frequently-asked-questions/definition-of-the-cultural-heritage/ (accessed January 6, 2013).

Capp, S. (1998). *The European institute of cultural routes* Council of Europe and Grand Duchy of Luxembourg.

Council of Europe. "Cultural, Heritage, and Diversity: Enlarged Partial Agreement On Cultural Routes." Council of Europe. http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/routes/default_en.asp. (accessed December 17, 2012).

GOV.UK, Inside Government. "Policy, Protecting and improving people's enjoyment of the countryside." United Kingdom GOV.UK, https://www.gov.uk/government/policies/protecting-and-improving-people-s-enjoyment-of-the-countryside (accessed June 16, 2013)

ICOMOS: International Council on Monuments and Sites. "The ICOMOS Charter on Cultural Routes." October 4, 2008. *International Scientific Committee on Cultural Routes*. Sixteenth General Assembly. Quebec, Canada.

King, Thomas and Patricia Parker. "Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties." *National Register Bulletin* no. 38 (1998)

Kreps, Christina. "Indigenous Curation as Intangible Cultural Heritage: Thoughts on the Relevance of the 2003 UNESCO Convention." *Theorizing Cultural Heritage* vol. 1, no. 2 (2005).

Legislation.gov.uk "National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act 1949." Part IV, Section 52. United Kingdom, http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/Geo6/12-13-14/97 (accessed June 18, 2013)

Merriam-Webster Dictionary, online ed., s.v. "heritage." http://www.reference.com/browse/cultural%20heritage?fromAsk=true&o=100074 (accessed December 27, 2012).

National Park Service. "How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation." *National Register Bulletin* no. 15

National Park Service. "National Trails System." National Trails System. http://www.nps.gov/nts/ (accessed January 6, 2013).

National Park Service. "NPS-28: Cultural Resource Management Guideline." Appendix A: Glossary." http://www.nps.gov/history/history/online_books/nps28/28appena.htm (accessed December 27, 2012).

National Park Service. "Teaching Cultural Heritage Preservation, Historic Preservation Cultural Resource Stewardship and Related Fields." http://www.nps.gov/history/crdi/colleges/Front%20Matter-TCHP%20Workbook.pdf (accessed December 27, 2012).

National Park Service. "What Are National Heritage Areas?" National Heritage Areas. http://www.nps.gov/history/heritageareas/FAQ/(accessed January 6, 2013).

National Trails. "About the National Trails." United Kingdom National Trails, http://www.nationaltrail.co.uk/text.asp?PageId=2 (accessed June 10, 2013).

Natural England. "Types of public rights of way" United Kingdom Natural England, www.naturalengland.org.uk/ourwork/access/rightsofway/prow/default.aspx

Natural England. "What is the legal status of public rights of way?" United Kingdom Natural England, http://www.naturalengland.org.uk/ourwork/access/rightsofway/legalprow/default.aspx (accessed June 15, 2013)

Oliver, Paul. *The Story of the Blues*. Dexter, Michigan: Northeastern University Press, 1998.

The Getty Research Institute. *Art and Architecture Thesaurus*, online ed., s.v. "cultural heritage." http://www.getty.edu/vow/AATFullDisplay?find=cultural+heritage&logic=AND&note=&english=N&prev_page=1&subjectid=300265422 (accessed February 2, 2013).

The National Trails System Act. *U.S. Code*. Vol. 16, secs. 1241-1251 (2009).

Tyler, Norman, Ted J. Ligibel, and Ilene R. Tyler. *Historic Preservation: An Introduction to Its History, Principles, and Practice*, 2nd ed. New York: W. E. Norton and Company, Inc. 2009

U.S. Department of State, International Information Programs. "A Living Legacy: Preserving Intangible Culture." *eJournal USA* vol. 15, no. 8. http://www.america.gov/media/pdf/ejs/0810.pdf#popup (accessed December 29, 2012).

UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 1946-1981: first steps." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization, http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?lg=en&pg=00308 (accessed December 28, 2012).

UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 1982: Mondiacult (Mexico)." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization, http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?lg=en&pg=00309 (accessed December 28, 2012).

UNESCO "Intangible Heritage, 2000 onwards and the drafting of the Convention." U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization, http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?lg=en&pg=00310 (accessed December 28, 2012).

UNESCO. (1972) *Convention concerning the protection of the world cultural and natural heritage.* Paris, France

UNESCO. (2003). *Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage.* Paris, France.

UNESCO. "Routes as a Part of Our Cultural Heritage (Madrid, Spain, November 1994)." December 12-17, 1994. Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage. *World Heritage Committee.* 18th Session. Phuket, Thailand.

UNESCO. Executive Board, 161st 2001, Paris. *Report on the Preliminary Study on the Advisability of Regulating Internationally, Through a New Standard-Setting Instrument, the Protection of Traditional Culture and Folklore.* 161 EX/15-pages 5-6.

UNESCO: U.N. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization. (1998). *Convention concerning the protection of the world cultural and natural heritage*. Kyoto, Japan.

World Commission on Culture and Development at UNESCO, eds. Michael Gibson, Paul Streeten. *Our Creative Diversity.* Paris, UNESCO: July 1996.